Fall 1996

The generation of predictive inferences and the availability of contextual information

Michelle Lenore Rizzella

University of New Hampshire, Durham

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholars.unh.edu/dissertation

Recommended Citation

https://scholars.unh.edu/dissertation/1922

This Dissertation is brought to you for free and open access by the Student Scholarship at University of New Hampshire Scholars' Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in Doctoral Dissertations by an authorized administrator of University of New Hampshire Scholars' Repository. For more information, please contact nicole.hentz@unh.edu.
INFORMATION TO USERS

This manuscript has been reproduced from the microfilm master. UMI films the text directly from the original or copy submitted. Thus, some thesis and dissertation copies are in typewriter face, while others may be from any type of computer printer.

The quality of this reproduction is dependent upon the quality of the copy submitted. Broken or indistinct print, colored or poor quality illustrations and photographs, print bleedthrough, substandard margins, and improper alignment can adversely affect reproduction.

In the unlikely event that the author did not send UMI a complete manuscript and there are missing pages, these will be noted. Also, if unauthorized copyright material had to be removed, a note will indicate the deletion.

Oversize materials (e.g., maps, drawings, charts) are reproduced by sectioning the original, beginning at the upper left-hand corner and continuing from left to right in equal sections with small overlaps. Each original is also photographed in one exposure and is included in reduced form at the back of the book.

Photographs included in the original manuscript have been reproduced xerographically in this copy. Higher quality 6" x 9" black and white photographic prints are available for any photographs or illustrations appearing in this copy for an additional charge. Contact UMI directly to order.

UMI
A Bell & Howell Information Company
300 North Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor MI 48106-1346 USA
313/761-4700 800/521-0600

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
THE GENERATION OF PREDICTIVE INFERENCES AND THE 
AVAILABILITY OF CONTEXTUAL INFORMATION

Michelle L. Rizzella

BA, State University of New York at Stony Brook, 1989

MA, University of New Hampshire, 1992

DISSERTATION

Submitted to the University of New Hampshire
in Partial Fulfillment of
the Requirements for the Degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

in

Psychology

September, 1996
This dissertation has been examined and approved.

Edward J. O'Brien
Professor of Psychology

John Limber
Associate Professor of Psychology

Daniel G. Morrow
Research Associate Professor of Psychology

Grant Cioffi
Associate Professor of Education

Sylvia Russell
Associate Professor of Computer Science

Date 26, 1994
DEDICATION

This dissertation is dedicated to the three people I most dearly love: my father, my mother and Craig
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This dissertation has been tremendously improved through the comments and support of my committee, Dr. John Limber, Dr. Dan Morrow, Dr. Sylvia Russell, and Dr. Grant Cioffi. I would especially like to thank John for making me struggle with the issue of what constitutes an inference and for recommending "Bedtime for Bonzo."

I am grateful to my present lab mates, Anne Cook and Jenny Halleran, for helping me generate some of my dissertation materials and for proofreading this document. I am also grateful to my former (but not forgotten) lab mates, Jason Albrecht and Chris Hakala whose absence from the lab has been greatly felt. I am honored to call Jason my mentor and partner in crime. He taught me many indispensable lessons ranging from running a lab to writing memos. I thank Chris for believing those memos, choosing to root for the Red Sox (which almost made it too easy to torment him) and for enduring all of my gibes. I could not have chosen two better colleagues to work with.

It is a pleasure for me to acknowledge the most important person involved in my graduate career, Dr. Edward J. O'Brien. I am indebted to the wisdom, guidance and unyielding support he provided throughout the years. This made all the difference between my leaving UNH with and without a Ph.D.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

**DEDICATION** ........................................................................................................ iv

**ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS** ........................................................................................ v

**LIST OF TABLES** .................................................................................................. viii

**ABSTRACT** .............................................................................................................. ix

**SECTION** .................................................................................................................. PAGE

I. INTRODUCTION ........................................................................................................... 1

II. NECESSARY INFERENCEs ........................................................................................... 4

   Anaphoric Inferences ............................................................................................... 5

   Bridging Inferences ................................................................................................ 8

   Causal Antecedent Inferences .............................................................................. 10

III. ELABORATIVE INFERENCEs ....................................................................................... 15

   Instantiations ........................................................................................................... 15

   Instrumental Inferences .......................................................................................... 18

   Predictive Inferences ............................................................................................. 21

IV. LOCAL AND GLOBAL COHERENCE ....................................................................... 26

   Causal Models of Coherence ............................................................................... 28

   Global Models of Coherence ................................................................................. 30

V. EXPERIMENTS ........................................................................................................... 39

   EXPERIMENT 1 ........................................................................................................ 40

   EXPERIMENT 2 ......................................................................................................... 49

   EXPERIMENT 3 ......................................................................................................... 54
LIST OF TABLES

Table 1. Sample Passage for Experiments 1 and 2.................................41
Table 2. Results from Experiment 1..........................................................57
Table 3. Results from Experiment 2..........................................................53
Table 4. Sample Passage for Experiments 3, 4, and 5............................57
Table 5. Results from Experiment 3..........................................................58
Table 6. Results from Experiment 4..........................................................62
Table 7. Results from Experiment 5..........................................................65
ABSTRACT

THE GENERATION OF PREDICTIVE INFERENCES AND THE AVAILABILITY OF CONTEXTUAL INFORMATION

by

Michelle L. Rizzella
University of New Hampshire, September, 1996

Five experiments were conducted to determine whether readers generate predictive inferences when biasing context was available at either a local level (i.e., in short-term memory) or global level (i.e., in long-term memory). Subjects read passages that described two characters; one description contained contextual information supporting a predictive inference and the other description did not. Experiments 1 and 2 examined whether subjects generated a predictive inference when biasing context was locally available. Reading time differences in Experiment 1 demonstrated that subjects experienced comprehension difficulty when critical sentences were inconsistent with biasing context. Experiment 2 showed that subjects had generated a predictive inference when accompanied by biasing context. Experiments 3 and 4 replicated the results of Experiments 1 and 2 respectively, when biasing context was available at a global level. Reading time differences in Experiment 3 demonstrated that subjects experienced comprehension difficulty when critical sentences were inconsistent with the biasing context. Experiment 4 showed that subjects had generated a predictive inference when accompanied by biasing context.
Experiment 5 confirmed that biasing context was available at a global level in Experiments 3 and 4. Results are discussed in terms of several recent discourse comprehension models.
I. INTRODUCTION

A primary goal in the study of discourse comprehension is to accurately describe the memory representation of text and the processes that are involved in the development of that representation. In order to develop a fully enriched representation, readers typically infer connections between explicitly stated information and general world knowledge (Glenberg, Meyer, & Lindem, 1987; Morrow, Greenspan, & Bower, 1987). Previous research has demonstrated that readers generate inferences related to the development of the discourse model such as those involved in bridging ideas (Clark, 1977; Haviland & Clark, 1974), causal relations (Keenan, Baillet, & Brown, 1984; Myers, Shinjo, & Duffy, 1987; Trabasso, Secco, & van den Broek, 1984; Trabasso & Suh, 1993; van den Broek, 1990), spatial relations (Glenberg et al., 1987; Morrow et al., 1987) and emotional states of characters (Gernsbacher, Goldsmith, & Robertson, 1992).

Because an enormous number of inferences can be generated during reading, one goal of discourse processing models is to predict what types of inferences are likely to be generated during comprehension given the constraints of the reader's limited capacity (Balota, Flores d'Arcais, & Rayner, 1990; Graesser & Bower, 1990; McKoon & Ratcliff, 1992; Singer, 1988; Whitney, 1987). Most models of discourse comprehension assume that readers have a limited capacity system restricting the amount of information that can be processed at one time. Because of these capacity constraints, these models
further assume that text is processed over a series of cycles in which only a small portion of information is encoded during each cycle (Kintsch & van Dijk, 1978; Fletcher & Bloom, 1988). A subset of this information is selected to be maintained in a short-term memory buffer in order for new information on subsequent cycles to be connected to it. The bridging of information across cycles presumably results in a complete memory representation of the text. As long as incoming information can be connected to the current contents of the short-term memory buffer on each cycle, the text is considered coherent (Fletcher, 1981, 1986). If not, then the reader must draw an inference in order to maintain coherence.

Currently, researchers have attempted to identify the types of inferences that are generated during the reading process (Graesser & Kreutz, 1993; Kintsch, 1993; Magliano & Graesser, 1991; McKoon & Ratcliff, 1986a, 1986b; 1992; Murray, Klin, & Myers, 1993; O'Brien, Shank, Myers, & Rayner, 1988; Potts, Keenan, & Golding, 1988; Singer, 1990). The types of inferences can be classified into one of two general categories: necessary inferences and elaborative inferences. Necessary inferences serve to maintain coherence. That is, they are drawn during a coherence break in order to reestablish coherence. Because necessary inferences are critical to comprehension, there is considerable evidence that readers draw them during comprehension (e.g., Dell, McKoon, & Ratcliff, 1983; McKoon & Ratcliff, 1980, 1992; O'Brien, Duffy, & Myers, 1986; Keenan et al., 1984). In contrast, there is considerably less
consensus on the conditions under which readers generate elaborative inferences; that is, inferences that serve to enhance or embellish explicitly stated information (Corbett & Dosher, 1978; Dosher & Corbett, 1982; Duffy, 1986; Murray et al., 1993; O'Brien et al., 1988; Singer & Ferreira, 1983). One goal of the present experiments is to further examine the conditions in which elaborative inferences are generated during comprehension.
II. NECESSARY INFERENCES

When comprehending a text, readers attempt to generate connections between new information and information that precedes it. Often, however, there is no direct connection between these two pieces of information. Even so, comprehension appears to proceed smoothly. Consider the following example (Clark, 1977):

1a. The pitcher threw the ball to first base.
1b. The pitcher threw to first base.
2. The ball sailed into right field.

The connection between sentences 1a and 2 is explicit due to the mentioning of ball in each sentence. However, the connection between sentences 1b and 2 is not so direct. In order to fully understand what is meant by sentences 1b and 2, the reader must infer that the pitcher threw the ball. This provides a link between the two sentences. If the reader fails to make such a connection, comprehension is disrupted. Because such inferences are crucial to the understanding of the text, there is considerable agreement that they are reliably encoded during reading (Haviland & Clark, 1974; Keenan et al., 1984; McKoon & Ratcliff, 1992; van den Broek, 1990). In the following sections, I will describe various types of necessary inferences and discuss evidence that they are encoded during comprehension.
Anaphoric Inferences

One of the most common types of necessary inferences is an anaphoric inference. If a text introduces a discourse entity and then refers to that entity indirectly, the reader must infer that the reference is the established discourse entity in order for complete comprehension to be obtained (e.g., Kintsch & van Dijk, 1978; van Dijk & Kintsch, 1983). Consider the following example from McKoon and Ratcliff (1980; see also Corbett & Chang, 1983; Chang, 1980; Clark & Sengul, 1979; Dell, McKoon, & Ratcliff, 1983; Ehrlich & Rayner, 1983):

1. A burglar surveyed the garage set back from the street.
2. Several milk bottles were piled at the curb.
3. The banker and her husband were on vacation.
4a. The criminal slipped away from the streetlamp.
4b. A cat slipped away from the streetlamp.

In sentence 4a, "the criminal" is an anaphor that makes reference to its antecedent, "burglar." The reader must infer that criminal and burglar are the same entities. If the anaphoric inference is not made in sentence 4a, criminal and burglar will be two separate entities in the discourse model. McKoon and Ratcliff had subjects read short paragraphs similar to the previous example. The first sentence contained an antecedent (e.g., burglar). The final sentence contained either an anaphor of the antecedent (e.g., the criminal) or contained a word not related to the antecedent (e.g., a cat). McKoon and Ratcliff immediately probed for the antecedent (e.g., burglar). Recognition times were faster for the antecedent when the final sentence contained an anaphor than when it did not.
McKoon and Ratcliff concluded that the anaphor reactivated its antecedent.

O'Brien et al. (1986) pointed out several potential problems with McKoon and Ratcliff's (1980) experiments. First, McKoon and Ratcliff may have used an inappropriate control sentence because it always introduced a new topic (e.g., "A cat slipped away from the streetlamp"). Thus, longer response times may have occurred in the control condition because of the presentation of a new topic and not because the anaphor reactivated the antecedent in the test condition. A new topic may have caused a general interference effect or it may have bumped the antecedent from active memory. Second, fast response times to the antecedent may have been due to lexical priming caused by the semantic relation between the antecedent and the anaphor. Finally, recognition times may have been faster in the test condition because subjects respond faster to probes if they are more compatible with the sentences they have just read (see Seidenberg, Waters, Sanders & Langer, 1984 for backward integration effects).

O'Brien et al. (1986) were careful to address each of these potential problems by using additional control sentences and different response time measures such as reading time, naming time and recognition time. O'Brien et al. replicated and extended McKoon and Ratcliff's results by demonstrating that when a antecedent is not immediately available by the time an anaphor is encountered, the reader will search memory for the antecedent (see also O'Brien, 1987; O'Brien & Albrecht, 1991; O'Brien, Plewes, & Albrecht, 1990). Consider the following example from O'Brien et al., 1986:
Bill was late for work again. He had forgotten to set his alarm and had overslept. To top it all off, he was now behind a bus that was having engine trouble. As the bus pulled into a busy intersection, its engine sputtered and died. Bill shook his head in disbelief as the traffic around him came to a halt. There was an important sales meeting this morning, and he was afraid he would miss it. His boss had already warned him once about his tendency to oversleep. Bill sighed as he caught sight of a digital clock in a nearby bank window. He sat and stared at

Reinstatement: the stalled vehicle not knowing what to do.
Semantic control: a police vehicle not knowing what to do.
Baseline control: the digital clock not knowing what to do.

The condition of interest is the reinstatement condition. In this condition, an anaphoric inference must be drawn because the last line of the passage makes an anaphoric reference (e.g. "the stalled vehicle") to a backgrounded antecedent (e.g. "bus"). In order for comprehension to proceed smoothly, the reader must search memory for the antecedent, reinstate it into active memory and then infer that the anaphor (i.e., the stalled vehicle) is the same entity as the antecedent (i.e., bus). Following the last sentence of the passage, readers had to respond to the antecedent that occurred earlier in the passage.

O'Brien et al. compared the reinstatement condition to three additional conditions in their experiments: a baseline condition, a semantic control condition and a preanaphor condition. The semantic control condition introduced a category concept (e.g., a police vehicle) that was semantically related to the
to-be-probed antecedent (e.g., bus) but did not actually refer back to it. The last line of the reinstatement condition was eliminated to make up the preanaphor condition. Finally, similar to the reinstatement condition, the baseline control condition contained an anaphoric reference (e.g., digital clock) to a concept still in active memory (e.g., digital clock). Thus, reinstatement is still necessary in both the baseline and reinstatement conditions. However, because the anaphoric antecedent is closer to its anaphor in the baseline condition than in the reinstatement condition, O'Brien et al. predicted it would take less time for readers to reinstate the antecedent in the baseline condition. If so, then reading times for the reinstatement sentences should be longer compared to sentences in the other conditions.

O'Brien et al. discovered that the last sentence took longer to read in the reinstatement condition than the other conditions. This finding suggests that the additional reading time was used to reinstate the anaphoric antecedent. Furthermore, O'Brien et al. demonstrated with both naming time and recognition time procedures that the anaphoric antecedent was more accessible in the reinstatement condition than in any other condition. Taken together, these findings suggest that readers searched memory for the anaphoric antecedent, restated it into active memory and then inferred that it was the same entity as the anaphor.

**Bridging Inferences**

Other types of necessary inferences can be more complicated than
anaphoric inferences in that they require readers to tap into world knowledge relevant to the explicit text in order to be drawn. For example, bridging inferences serve to fill in "conceptual gaps" between sentences. Readers rely on general world knowledge to connect pieces of information together to form a coherent story. Consider the following example from Keenan and Kintsch (1974): "Police are hunting a man in hiding. The wife of Bob Birch disclosed illegal business practices in an interview on Sunday." These two sentences are not coherent unless the bridging inference "Bob Birch is the man who is hiding" is made by readers. In order to test this, Keenan and Kintsch presented readers with verification statements that either contained inferential or explicit statements. They found that readers were just as quick verifying the bridging inferences as another version of the text that explicitly stated the inference, suggesting that readers had encoded bridging inferences (see also Clark & Sengul, 1979; Haviland & Clark, 1974).

Although Keenan and Kintsch's findings indicate that bridging inferences are encoded in the discourse representation, their results did not determine if readers had encoded them on-line or generated them when presented with the verification statements. Presumably, because necessary inferences are required for comprehension, necessary inferences should be drawn as rapidly as possible so that the comprehension process proceeds smoothly.

Haviland and Clark (1974) provided support for this hypothesis. They presented readers with pairs of sentences such as "We got the picnic supplies
out of the car. The beer was warm." In order for comprehension to be maintained, the second sentence requires that readers make the bridging inference that "beer" is part of the picnic supplies. Haviland and Clark reasoned that if readers generate a bridging inference then it should take additional processing time to read the second sentence as compared to a control sentence that did not require a bridging inference. Sentences that required readers to draw a bridging inference resulted in longer reading times than control sentences. Thus, these results indicate that readers do generate bridging inferences on-line in order for comprehension to be maintained.

Causal Antecedent Inferences

Other types of necessary inferences such as causal antecedent inferences are important to the development of a coherent text representation as well. Causal antecedent inferences involve a logical causal link between events. Specifically, causal antecedent inferences provide explanations for events or states that occurred in the text. Thus, causal antecedent inferences are critical to the comprehension process (Bloom et al., 1990; Fletcher et al., 1990; Keenan et al., 1984; Myers, Shinjo, & Duffy, 1987; van den Broek, 1990). Past research has demonstrated that readers will infer a causal antecedent to connect to a causal consequence when an explicitly mentioned causal antecedent is not available in the text (Keenan et al., 1984; Myers et al., 1987). For example, Keenan et al. presented readers with pairs of statements that varied in the degree of causal relatedness. Consider the following example:
1a. Joey's big brother punched him again and again.
1b. Racing down the hill, Joey fell off his bike.
1c. Joey's crazy mother became furiously angry with him.
1d. Joey went to a neighbor's house to play.
2. The next day his body was covered with bruises.

Subjects rated degree of causal relatedness between the first sentence and sentence 2 strongest for sentence 1a, followed by sentence 1b, then 1c and finally 1d. A separate set of subjects read the pairs of sentences and were later asked to recall the first sentence when the second sentence was used as a cue.

Two important findings emerged from Keenan et al.'s study. First, reading time for the second sentence increased as degree of causal relatedness decreased. Second, memory for the first sentence resulted in a quadratic, inverted U-shaped function; that is, memory was highest for the first sentence when it shared an intermediate causal link (i.e., sentences 1b and 1c) with the second sentence and lowest when it shared either the strongest causal link or the weakest causal link (i.e., sentences 1a and 1d, respectively). To account for these results, Keenan et al. (1984) argued that as causality decreased, readers took longer to read the second sentence because they attempted to infer additional causal antecedents in order to causally connect the two sentences. For example, in sentence 1b, readers may have inferred that Joey was bruised because he hit the ground after falling off his bike. Likewise, in sentence 1c, readers may have inferred that Joey's mother hit him. If readers are successful in generating causal antecedents, additional processing will result in longer
reading times but also higher recall. However, if two causal statements are already causally linked, as in sentences 1a and 2, then readers will not infer additional causal links thereby requiring less processing and resulting in faster reading time but poorer recall. If readers need to generate a causal link but are not successful as in sentences 1d and 2, the additional processing will still result in longer reading time but poor recall. In sum, Keenan's results provide evidence that readers infer causal antecedents required for comprehension when an explicit causal antecedent is not available in the text. Although inferring a causal relation between sentences takes additional processing time, memory for the sentences will be improved.

More recent research has demonstrated that readers will infer a causal connection between a consequence and an antecedent no longer in active memory. For example, Rizzella and O'Brien (in press) have demonstrated that readers will infer that a backgrounded, earlier mentioned antecedent caused an event even though a more recent antecedent was available. They presented readers with passages that contained a backgrounded causal antecedent and a more recent causal antecedent to a causal consequence. Consider the following example from Rizzella and O'Brien (in press):

Jimmy was playing baseball with his friend. Jimmy's friend pitched the ball to him. The ball hit Jimmy in the arm. (Jimmy could not believe how much the pitch hurt. His arm muscles began to feel very sore. Jimmy knew it would hurt for days. His arm even began to turn red and swell.) Because of this, Jimmy stopped playing and said he was going home. Jimmy hopped on his bike
and sped down the street. Unfortunately, he turned too sharply and fell off his bike. Consequently, Jimmy stood up and swept the dirt from his pants. As he was wiping his pants, Jimmy found a piece of gum in his pocket. He opened the wrapper and put the gum in his mouth. When he arrived home, his mother asked him why he was bruised.

There are two potential causal antecedents of the consequent event in the final sentence of the sample passage (e.g., Jimmy is bruised); an early causal antecedent (e.g., the ball hit Jimmy) and a more recent causal antecedent (e.g., Jimmy fell off his bike). The early causal antecedent was either elaborated or not. The early elaborated antecedent condition contained the sentences in parentheses. Rizzella and O'Brien found that when the early causal antecedent had been elaborated, the causal consequent event reactivated it even though the more recent causal antecedent was available. This finding suggests that readers will make necessary inferential connections even when a more recent cause is available.

Thus, there is general agreement that necessary inferences accompany comprehension. The types of necessary inferences range from simple, text-connecting inferences such as anaphoric inferences to more complicated inferences requiring world knowledge such as bridging inferences and causal antecedent inferences. In addition, necessary inferences have been shown to occur under a variety of conditions; they have been shown to link nearby text ideas (e.g., Keenan et al., 1985; McKoon & Ratcliff, 1980) as well as distal text ideas (e.g., O'Brien et al., 1986; Rizzella & O'Brien, in press). Although it is
established that necessary inferences are encoded during comprehension, a focus of controversy is whether elaborative inferences are encoded as well. The next section discusses various elaborative inferences and the conditions in which they are generated on-line.
III. ELABORATIVE INFERENCES

Although research clearly demonstrates that readers generate necessary inferences on-line, there is much less consensus whether readers reliably generate elaborative inferences (e.g., Murray et al., 1993; O'Brien et al., 1988; Potts et al., 1988; Singer & Ferreira, 1983). Because elaborative inferences serve only to embellish the text and are not required to maintain coherence, some researchers argue that they are not usually drawn (e.g., Graesser, Singer, & Trabasso, 1994; McKoon & Ratcliff, 1992; Singer, Graesser, & Trabasso, 1994; van den Broek, 1990). However, research has demonstrated that elaborative inferences are generated under certain conditions: when readers are engaged in specific reading strategies (e.g., Corbett & Dosher, 1978) or when context constrains the type of the elaborative inference (e.g., Garrod, O'Brien, Morris, & Rayner, 1990; Graesser et al., 1994; O'Brien et al., 1988). Types of elaborative inferences are instantiations (e.g., Anderson & Ortony, 1975; Garrod & Sanford, 1977), instrumental inferences (e.g., Corbett & Dosher, 1978; McKoon & Ratcliff, 1981; Singer, 1980), and predictive inferences (Duffy, 1986; Fincher-Kiefer, 1993, 1995; Keefe & McDaniel, 1993; McKoon & Ratcliff, 1986a, 1986b; Murray, et al., 1993; Singer & Ferreira, 1983; Whitney, Ritchie, & Crane, 1992).

Instantiations

Instantiations occur when a specific concept is inferred from a general concept. Anderson and Ortony (1975) presented readers with passages that
contained a sentence such as "The container held the apples." They found that readers were faster to recall the sentence if they were presented with a semantically associated cue (e.g., basket) than a non-semantically associated cue. Anderson and Ortony argued that this difference was due to readers instantiating "basket" from the concept "container." However, Anderson and Ortony's results are difficult to interpret because they do not distinguish between encoding and retrieval processes. That is, it is not clear whether an inference was drawn during reading or when the retrieval cue was presented. Because the retrieval cues used in Anderson and Ortony's study were contextually relevant to the texts, readers may have used the retrieval cues to work backwards in the texts (e.g., Corbett & Dosher, 1978; Potts, Keenan, & Golding, 1988) and drawn the inference when given the retrieval cue.

Garrod and Sanford (1977) contended that readers automatically instantiate a general concept from a specific concept but do not automatically instantiate a specific concept from a general concept. They presented a pair of sentences such as:

1a. A (robin/goose) would wander into the house.
1b. The bird was attracted by the larder.

2a. A bird would wander into the house.
2b. The (robin/goose) was attracted by the larder.

Garrod and Sanford observed that reading time for sentence 1b was faster than sentence 2b. They argued that the faster reading times occurred because
specific concepts (e.g., robin or goose) activate general concepts (e.g., bird) whereas general concepts (e.g., bird) do not activate specific concepts (e.g., robin or goose). However, one potential problem with Garrod and Sanford's experiment is that if an elaborative inference is being made, it is a minimal elaborative inference because it is necessary that readers know that a robin or goose is a bird in order for them to understand the sentences.

More convincing evidence that readers generate instantiations was produced by O'Brien et al. (1988). Consider the following example:

All the mugger wanted was to steal the woman's money. But when she screamed, he [stabbed] [assaulted] her with his (knife/weapon) in an attempt to quiet her. He threw the knife into the bushes and ran away.

There were two context versions of each passage.; a high-context version and a low context version. The high context version was created by including the information in the first set of brackets (e.g., stabbed) and the low context version was created by including the information in the second set of brackets (e.g., assaulted). In addition, each passage either contained a categorical concept (e.g., weapon) or a specific concept (e.g., knife). The final sentence contained an anaphoric mentioning (e.g., knife). When the context strongly suggested the specific concept, there was no difference in gaze durations for the anaphoric mentioning following either the categorical concept or the specific concept. This finding suggests that when context strongly implied a particular category member, readers had instantiated a specific concept when they read the
categorical concept. In contrast, when the context did not strongly imply the specific concept, gaze durations for the anaphoric mentioning were longer following the categorical concept suggesting that readers did not instantiate the specific concept. O'Brien et al. (1988) argued that when context is sufficient, readers will generate an elaborative inference on-line.

**Instrumental Inferences**

Another type of elaborative inference that has received considerable attention is the instrumental inference. An instrumental inference occurs when a specific object is inferred from a specific activity. For example, inferring "broom" while reading the sentence, "The man swept the floor" would be considered an instrumental inference.

Singer (1979; see also Corbett & Dosher, 1978) argued that instrumental inferences are not made by readers. He presented readers with sentences such as:

1a. The boy cleared the snow with a shovel.
1b. The boy cleared the snow from the stairs.
2. The shovel was heavy.

Singer found that readers were slower to read sentence 2 when it followed sentence 1b than when followed by sentence 1a. He reasoned that if readers were generating the instrumental inference (i.e., shovel) during the first sentence of the second example, there should not have been a reading time difference between the second sentences.
However, McKoon and Ratcliff (1981) have shown that readers will generate instrumental inferences when an instrument is familiar to readers and if that instrument was previously mentioned in the text. Consider the following example from McKoon and Ratcliff (1981):

Bobby got a saw, hammer, screwdriver, and square from his toolbox. He had already selected an oak tree as the site for his birdhouse. He had drawn a detailed blueprint and measured carefully. He marked the boards and cut them out.

Readers saw passages that mentioned a concept early in the passage (e.g., hammer). The final sentence either suggested the earlier mentioned object ("Bobby pounded the boards together with nails") or not ("Bobby stuck the boards together with glue"). Readers were faster at recognizing the concept "hammer" when the last sentence suggested the instrument than when it had not. McKoon and Ratcliff argued that this facilitation resulted from readers drawing the instrumental inference that Bobby used a hammer when presented with the final sentence "Bobby pounded the boards together with nails."

An alternative explanation posed by Keenan and her colleagues (Keenan, Golding, Potts, Jennings, & Aman, 1990; Keenan & Jennings, 1995a; 1995b) suggests that facilitation observed by McKoon and Ratcliff may be attributed to word-based priming. For example, readers may have activated the concept "hammer" by virtue of reading words (i.e., pounded, nails) that were semantically associated with it (see Collins & Loftus, 1975; Meyer & Schvaneveldt, 1971; Neely, 1976; 1977 for semantic activation of concepts).
Word-based priming is problematic when assessing inferences because it can lead to the conclusion that an inferential concept has been activated by the text or reader's knowledge when in fact, it may have only been semantically activated. Keenan and Jennings (1995a) controlled for word-based priming effects by adding a control condition to McKoon and Ratcliff's (1981) original study. The word-based priming control condition contained all of the words that were semantically related to the target instrument but did not actually imply the instrument. For example, the word-based priming sentence for the previous example was "He pounded his fist on the boards when he saw that he had no nails." Keenan and Jennings replicated McKoon and Ratcliff's finding that the target instrument was recognized faster in the inference condition than McKoon and Ratcliff's original control condition. However, readers were faster to recognize the instrument in the word-based priming condition than the control condition. Furthermore, no difference in latency was detected between the word-based priming condition and the inference condition. Taken together, these findings indicate that any facilitation for the target instrument was due to word-based priming and not elaborative inferencing.

Thus, the evidence that instrumental inferences are drawn on-line remains unclear. Many of the studies that do demonstrate instrumental inferences are methodologically flawed. In contrast, research on another type of elaborative inference, predictive inferences, has resulted in much more clear conclusions.
Predictive Inferences

Predictive inferences enable readers to forecast future events. Although research has demonstrated that readers generate inferences regarding prior events such as causal antecedents (e.g., Potts et al., 1988; Singer & Ferreira; 1983), there has been little support indicating that readers generate predictive inferences (e.g., Duffy, 1986; Singer & Ferreira; 1983; Whitney et al., 1992). Researchers have frequently proposed that predictive inferences are not generated on-line because there are too many alternative outcomes to consider, most of which would be erroneous, or because too much cognitive capacity is needed to predict a future event (Graesser & Clark, 1985; Johnson-Laird, 1983; Kintsch, 1988; Potts et al., 1988). Consider the following example from Duffy (1986):

John was eating in the dining car of a train. The waiter brought him a bowl of soup. John reached for the salt. Suddenly, the train screeched to a halt/slow down. The soup spilled in John's lap.

Duffy was interested in whether readers made the predictive inference that the soup spilled before the last sentence was actually encountered. She argued that if readers generated the predictive inference, then the concept "soup" should be more accessible in the "screeching halt" version than the "slow down" version because the causal link is stronger. However, Duffy did not find any accessibility differences for the concept "soup" between the two conditions, indicating that readers were not making the predictive inference. Similarly, Potts et al. (1988)
further demonstrated with a naming time task that readers do not make predictive inferences.

However, more recent research has demonstrated that readers will generate predictive inferences on-line as long as the event is highly likely or when the to-be-inferred event remains in focus (Keefe & McDaniel, 1993; Murray et al., 1993). Murray et al. (1993) pointed out that previous research regarding predictive inferences may have failed to detect them even though they may have been generated. For example, Murray et al. (1993) criticized Duffy's (1986) results because the "salt" sentence intervened between the concept "soup" and the "train screeching to a halt" sentence (see also Keefe & McDaniel, 1993 for similar findings). Thus, the intervening sentence may have served to bump the concept "soup" from focus which prevented readers from making the predictive inference of spilled soup.

To test this explanation, Murray et al. (1993) presented passages in which a future event was highly predictable and relevant information was kept in focus at the time of the test. Consider the following example from Murray et al. (1993):

Predicted version
Steven had been married for years, and his resentment had been building up. One day, no longer able to control his anger, he threw a delicate porcelain vase against the wall.

Control version
Steven had been married for years, and his happiness had been building up. One day, no longer able to control his impulses, he went out and purchased a delicate porcelain
There were two versions of each passage; a predicted version and a control version. The predicted version provided information that strongly implied a future event. For example, the sentence describing throwing a delicate porcelain vase against the wall may cause the reader to draw the predictive inference that the vase broke. The control version used many of the same words as the predicted version but it should not lead to the predictive inference. To test this, Murray et al. recorded naming time for a keyword from the targeted inference (e.g., break). Subjects were faster naming the keyword when it followed the predicted inference version than when it followed the control version. This result demonstrates that readers activate inferential concepts concerning predictions as long as they are highly predictable and in focus at the time of the test.

Recently, previous work has demonstrated that readers also predict character emotions (Gernsbacher et al., 1992). Although the area is relatively uncharted, character emotional reactions have been demonstrated to occur on-line. For example, Gernsbacher et al. (1992) were interested whether readers represent a character's emotional state in memory. Consider the following example from Gernsbacher et al. (1992):

Joe worked at the local 7-11 to get spending money while in school. One night, his best friend, Tom, came in to buy a soda. Joe needed to go back to the storage room for a second. While he was away, Tom noticed the cash register was open. Tom couldn't resist the open drawer and quickly took a ten dollar bill. Later that week, Tom learned that Joe had
been fired from the 7-11, because his cash had been low one night. It would be weeks before Tom's guilt/pride would subside.

The last sentence of each passage contained an emotion word that either matched or mismatched an emotional state implied by the passage. For example, after reading the example passage, readers may have inferred that Tom felt guilty. If so, then it should be easier to read the last sentence of the passage when it contains an emotion word that matches the reader's discourse representation (e.g., guilt) than when it contains an emotion word that mismatches the reader's discourse representation (e.g., pride). Gemsbacher et al. found that the last sentence was read more quickly when it contained an emotion word that matched the implied emotional state.

However, the previous finding does not rule out the possibility that sentences matching the implied emotional state were read faster because they made more sense with earlier information in the passage. For example, a sentence describing Tom's guilt makes more sense than a sentence describing Tom's pride given the previous context of the passage. Thus, readers may not have inferred a character emotion which led to faster reading times; rather they may have had less difficulty integrating those sentences with the developing representation. To rule out this possibility, Gemsbacher et al. eliminated the target sentence from each passage. Following the conclusion of each passage, readers were required to name a target word that either matched (e.g., guilt) or mismatched (e.g., pride) the implied emotional state. If readers do infer
character emotions, then they should name words that match the implied emotional state faster than words that mismatch the implied emotional state. This is exactly what Gernsbacher et al. found. Taken together, these results suggest that readers will infer character emotional states.

In sum, most of the current research on elaborative inferencing indicates that readers are cautious when generating elaborative inferences. Nevertheless, elaborative inferencing has been demonstrated when semantic and linguistic constraints are strong and when the to-be-inferred event is kept in focus. The next section will describe different comprehension models of necessary and elaborative inferencing.
IV. LOCAL AND GLOBAL COHERENCE

Currently, there are two primary positions that characterize the inferential process; a local coherence perspective and a global coherence perspective. Local coherence is established when currently processed information is integrated with the immediately preceding context (i.e., information in active memory, generally the preceding 1 - 3 sentences). In contrast, global coherence involves establishing connections between currently processed information and contextually relevant information no longer active in memory, as well as information currently in the contents of active memory.

Until recently, much research on inferential processing has focused on how necessary inferences establish local coherence. Necessary inferences drawn between currently processed information and information that immediately precedes it contribute to local coherence (e.g., Fletcher & Bloom, 1988; Kintsch & van Dijk, 1978). This view is best captured by the minimalist position (e.g., McKoon & Ratcliff, 1992; 1995). According to the minimalist position, readers generate inferences that are necessary for the maintenance of local coherence and only establish connections at a global level when local coherence is violated or global information is readily available. For example, McKoon and Ratcliff (1992) presented evidence supporting the local coherence perspective.

Consider the following passages from McKoon and Ratcliff's study:

**Globally Inconsistent**

**Introduction**

Curtis spied a tennis court in the park. His arm was healing from an injury and
needed a workout before the big match. So he needed an opponent. Curtis waved to a friend to join him.

Control Continuation
The friend came over and was an exhausting opponent. Curtis decided to go borrow some change for a drink. Curtis ran happily along the path.

Problem Continuation
Curtis' friend did not want to be Curtis' opponent. So Curtis decided to go home and study videotapes of his serve instead. Curtis ran happily along the path.

Locally Inconsistent

Introduction
Diane wanted to lose some weight. She thought she should lose at least 20 pounds. Diane thought cycling might help her lose some weight. She went to the garage to find her bike.

Control Continuation
Diane peddled 5 miles each day for 3 months and became very slim. She decided to go back to school to complete her degree. It took several years, but Diane finally reached her goal.

Problem Continuation
Diane's bike was broken and she couldn't afford a new one. So she went to the grocery store to buy grapefruit and yogurt. It took several years, but Diane finally reached her goal.

In the globally inconsistent example, local coherence is maintained but global coherence is violated. Specifically, Curtis has a goal to find a partner to work out his arm before a big match. After this information has been backgrounded, Curtis decides to go home and watch videotapes of his serve instead. According to McKoon and Ratcliff, the action of going home to watch videotapes is coherent
with the immediately preceding situation but is inconsistent with the global information of Curtis wanting to work out his arm. Because local coherence is maintained, however, McKoon and Ratcliff predicted that global information will not be available to readers. In contrast, consider the passage in which there is a local coherence break. The sentence describing Diane's broken bicycle is not locally coherent with the sentence of Diane going to the store to buy grapefruit and yogurt. According to the minimalist position, when confronted with a local coherence break, readers retrieve global information in order to resolve the local coherence break (i.e., Diane wanting to lose 20 pounds). McKoon and Ratcliff found that in the locally inconsistent passages, readers were faster to recognize a global probe (e.g., weight) in the problem continuation version than the control continuation version. In contrast, in the globally inconsistent passages, there was no difference between the control continuation version and the problem continuation version. These results indicated that readers did not notice inconsistencies between new information and global information when local coherence was preserved. Based on these findings, McKoon and Ratcliff (1992) concluded that readers strive to maintain local coherence and do not routinely maintain global coherence. Global coherence is established only when local coherence has been violated or when global information is easily available.

Causal Models of Coherence

Fletcher and his colleagues (Bloom et al., 1990; Fletcher, 1986; Fletcher & Bloom, 1988;) proposed the current-state selection strategy as a means to
merge causal network models (e.g., Trabasso & Sperry, 1985; Trabasso & van
den Broek, 1985) with the assumptions of short-term memory constraints of
earlier models (e.g., Kintsch & van Dijk, 1978). The strategy specifies that causal
connections are made between incoming information and causal antecedents
available in active memory. According to this model, a causal antecedent
remains in active memory as long as it has not been provided with a causal
consequence; once a causal antecedent is connected to a causal consequence,
it is transferred into long-term memory. If incoming information cannot be
causally connected to a causal antecedent, then a local coherence break occurs
and memory is searched for a causal antecedent.

Although primarily a local coherence model, global connections are
possible within the current-state selection strategy. A global connection is
established when a local coherence has been violated; that is, when a causal
consequence cannot be connected to a causal antecedent in active memory and
the reader must search memory for a causal antecedent. Thus, the current-state
selection strategy predicts that causal inferential connections necessary for the
maintenance of local coherence are generated on-line. Global necessary
inferences are made only when local coherence is violated.

Similarly, van den Broek (1990) proposed the causal inference maker
which assumes that readers generate only those inferences that are necessary
to maintain local coherence. As with the current-state selection strategy, readers
first seek to establish a local connection between a currently read consequence
and a causal antecedent in active memory. A global connection is made only when a local causal antecedent is not available or it does not provide a sufficient explanation for a currently read consequence (i.e., when local coherence has been violated). Similar to the predictions of the current-state selection strategy, the causal inference maker predicts that local necessary inferences are encoded during comprehension. Global necessary inferences are not encoded unless a local necessary inference cannot be made.

Furthermore, the causal inference maker specifies that elaborative inferences are drawn when previous text is highly sufficient for them to occur. Presumably, because the causal inference maker emphasizes local coherence, it implies that readers are more apt to draw elaborative inferences when highly sufficient context is locally available. According to the causal inference maker, readers are less likely to draw elaborative inferences when constraining context has been presented at a global level because this information is less accessible to readers.

**Global Models of Coherence**

The causal models of inferencing previously discussed are primarily local models. That is, global connections are not made unless local coherence has been violated. In fact, according to these models, any global inference drawn is an elaborative inference even if that inference is necessary to maintain global coherence. In contrast, advocates of global coherence models assert that readers rely on both local and global information when drawing inferences.
Readers reliably draw inferences between current information and information active in memory as well as contextually relevant information no longer active in memory (e.g., Albrecht & O'Brien, 1993). Connections between global pieces of information necessary for the maintenance of global coherence are drawn. Furthermore, these global connections are made whether local coherence is established or not.

Albrecht and O'Brien (1993) examined whether readers maintained global coherence when local coherence was intact. They presented passages containing a description elaborating on a particular characteristic of a protagonist. Following several sentences that served to background the characteristic, target sentences were presented which were either consistent or inconsistent with the characteristic. Consider the following passage from Albrecht and O'Brien (1993):

**Introduction**
Today, Mary was meeting a friend. She arrived early at the restaurant and decided to get a table. After she sat down, she started looking at the menu.

**Consistent Elaboration**
This was Mary's favorite restaurant because it had fantastic junk food. Mary enjoyed eating anything that was quick and easy to fix. In fact, she ate at McDonalds at least three times a week. Mary never worried about her diet and saw no reason to eat nutritious foods.
Inconsistent Elaboration
This was Mary's favorite restaurant because it had fantastic health food. Mary, a health nut, had been a strict vegetarian for ten years. Her favorite food was cauliflower. Mary was so serious about her diet that she refused to eat anything which was fried or cooked in grease.

Filler
After about ten minutes, Mary's friend arrived. It had been a few months since they had seen each other. Because of this they had a lot to talk about and chatted for over a half hour. Finally, Mary signaled the waiter to come take their orders. Mary checked the menu one more time. She had a hard time deciding what to have for lunch.

Critical Sentences
Mary ordered a cheeseburger and fries.
She handed the menu back to the waiter.

Conclusion
Her friend didn't have as much trouble deciding what she wanted. She ordered and they began to chat again. They didn't realize that there was so much for them to catch up on.

In this passage, the protagonist is either described as a strict vegetarian or as a fast-food addict. Later in the passage, the protagonist orders a cheeseburger; an act consistent with the fast-food addict description but inconsistent with the strict vegetarian description. Albrecht and O'Brien found that it took longer to read the target sentences when they followed the inconsistent elaboration than when they followed the consistent elaboration. This finding indicates that readers reactivated global information relevant to the current actions of the protagonist, even though the target sentences were locally
coherent with the preceding sentences (for similar findings see Huitema, Dopkins, Klin, & Myers, 1993; Myers, O'Brien, Albrecht, & Mason, 1994; O'Brien & Albrecht, 1992).

Initially, it seems that Albrecht and O'Brien's results contradict McKoon and Ratcliff's (1992) findings. However, Albrecht and O'Brien (1993) observed that the materials used by McKoon and Ratcliff actually justified the inconsistent action before the target sentences were encountered thereby reducing or even eliminating the inconsistency. For example, in McKoon and Ratcliff's study, readers learned that Curtis wanted to work out his arm but that he went home to watch videotapes instead. However, this inconsistency was justified by the reason that Curtis' opponent did not want to play tennis. In Albrecht and O'Brien's materials, the inconsistency was not reduced; it was simply backgrounded by neutral information.

Recently, more investigations have demonstrated that readers routinely access global information (e.g., Huitema, Dopkins, Klin, & Myers, 1993; Myers, O'Brien, Albrecht, & Mason, 1994; Rizzella & O'Brien, in press). Thus, the question discourse comprehension theorists are investigating involves the degree to which readers maintain global coherence. The following section describes two discourse comprehension models and the degree to which readers maintain local and global coherence.

Constructionist Model

The constructionist model recently proposed by Graesser and his
colleagues (Graesser, Bertus, & Magliano; 1995; Graesser & Kreutz; 1993; Graesser et al., 1994) contains a strategic view of how readers maintain global coherence. The constructionist model is built around the "search after meaning" principle: Readers routinely attempt to construct meaning from text by asking why certain events, actions and states have occurred. Answers to why questions consist of causal antecedents and superordinate goals (Graesser, 1981; Graesser, Lang, & Roberts, 1991) suggesting that these types of inferences are made during comprehension. Furthermore, Graesser and his colleagues contend that readers attempt to construct meaning at both local and global levels. Thus, inferences that are relevant to global coherence are generated on-line.

The constructionist model predicts that elaborative inferences are not normally generated on-line because they are not necessary to the construction of meaning of the text. However, it predicts that elaborative inferences will be drawn on-line if they are highly constrained by context and there are few alternative outcomes likely to occur. Therefore, as long as the previous conditions are met, the constructionist model predicts that elaborative inferences will be generated at both local and global levels.

*Resonance Model*

The resonance model as proposed by O'Brien and his colleagues (Albrecht & O'Brien, 1993; O'Brien, 1995; O'Brien & Albrecht, 1992) is based on the premise that global information becomes activated through a fast-acting,
passive resonance process (e.g., Albrecht & O'Brien, 1993; Garrod et al., 1990; Garrod & Sanford, 1988, 1990; Glenberg & Langston, 1992; O'Brien & Albrecht, 1992; Sanford & Garrod, 1981). For example, Albrecht and O'Brien (1993) argued that contextually-relevant inactive traces in the discourse model as well as relevant traces from general world knowledge resonate in response to related information or trace elements currently active in memory (e.g., Gillund & Shiffrin, 1984; Hintzman, 1986; Ratcliff, 1978). That is, incoming text elements and information currently active serve as a compound cue (Ratcliff & McKoon, 1988) and reactivate strongly related information from further back in the text. The extent to which relevant backgrounded traces resonate is a function of their strength and the degree to which they share overlapping features with information currently active in memory.

Recently, O'Brien (1995) proposed that the minimalist position can account for global inferencing if resonance is included as a mechanism for making global information readily available. In their original proposal, McKoon and Ratcliff (1992, 1995) argued that readers have access to global information only when local coherence has been violated or when global information is easily available. However, McKoon and Ratcliff failed to specify a mechanism predicting when global information was easily accessible. Once resonance is incorporated into the minimalist position, the minimalist position makes clear predictions concerning global inferences. For example, when there is little or no featural overlap between pieces of information, global inferences are much less
likely to be fully encoded because information from long-term memory and
general world knowledge is less accessible (see McKoon & Ratcliff, 1986a).
When featural overlap increases between pieces of information, global
inferences are more likely to be fully encoded (e.g., Albrecht & O'Brien, 1993;
Murray et al., 1993; O'Brien at al., 1988).

Reconsider the findings of Rizzella and O'Brien (in press) as described
earlier. A strict view of the minimalist hypothesis predicts that the more recent
causal antecedent will be connected to the causal consequent event
independent of whether the early causal antecedent is elaborated or not.
However, when the component of easily available information is defined by
resonance, the minimalist hypothesis predicts that distant causal antecedents
are more likely to be accessed when there is great featural overlap between an
early causal antecedent and the causal consequent event. According to
resonance, any causal antecedent will resonate to various degrees depending
on the degree of featural overlap between it and the consequent event.
Presumably, the resonance signal decays over time so that earlier causal
antecedents are less likely to be retrieved than more recent causal antecedents.
However, when an early causal antecedent is elaborated, the degree of featural
overlap between it and the consequent event increases which results in
reactivation of the early causal antecedent.

In conclusion, the minimalist hypothesis fits well with the resonance
model. The original minimalist hypothesis predicts that only those inferences
necessary to maintain local coherence are routinely encoded. However, the resonance model extends the minimalist hypothesis by predicting that elaborative inferences and inferences required for global coherence are encoded when based on easily available information (i.e., when there is featural overlap) either from explicit statements from the text or general world knowledge.

**Summary**

The previous discussion provides a motivation for the current experiments. The section on necessary and elaborative inferencing described the various types of inferences and the conditions required for specific inferences to be made on-line. The local and global coherence section described the predictions of several discourse comprehension models regarding inferencing and local and global coherence. With respect to elaborative inferencing, local models of coherence predict that they are not routinely made on-line except under certain conditions. For example, these models predict that readers will generate an elaborate inference when context is sufficient. However, these models further predict that this should occur only when context is locally available (i.e., in active memory). Similarly, global models of coherence predict that elaborative inferences are not typically generated on-line except when context is constraining. However, global models differ from local models in that context can be available at a global level (i.e., in long-term memory) when an elaborate inference is drawn. Thus, the purpose of the current experiments is to determine whether elaborate inferencing occurs only when constraining
context is available at a local level or at a global level.

To test this, Experiments 1 and 2 were designed to determine if readers draw a predictive inference when information constraining the predicted outcome is locally available. The finding that predictive inferences are drawn when constraining information is locally available is consistent with both local and global models of coherence. Experiments 3 and 4 were designed to determine if predictive inferences occur when constraining information is available only at a global level. The current-state selection strategy and the causal inference maker predict that readers will not draw global predictive inferences because the constraining context will not be available in active memory. In contrast, the resonance position predicts that readers will draw global predictive inferences as long as the globally available context resonates with current information when the inference is drawn. Similarly, the constructionist model also predicts that global predictive inferences will be generated during comprehension. Finally, Experiment 5 was designed to confirm that the context was globally available.
V. EXPERIMENTS

The present experiments were designed to further investigate the influence global and local information have on elaborative inferencing. Specifically, the experiments were designed to assess whether predictive inferences are drawn when constraining context is available at either a local level or global level. Experiments 1 and 2 were designed to test whether predictive inferences are drawn when highly constraining context is locally available. Experiment 1 was designed to compare the ease of integration when critical sentences were consistent or inconsistent with the locally constraining context. If readers do not notice the inconsistency between the context and the critical sentences, then there should be no difference in reading times between the inconsistent and consistent conditions. Experiment 2 was designed to directly test whether readers generate a local predictive inference.

Experiments 3 and 4 were designed to assess if predictive inferences are drawn when constraining context was available at a global level. Experiment 3 was designed to compare the ease of integration when critical sentences were consistent or inconsistent with globally constraining context. If readers do not notice the inconsistency between the context and the critical sentences, then there should be no difference in reading times between the inconsistent and consistent conditions. Experiment 4 was designed to directly test whether readers generate a global predictive inference.

Two dependent measures will be implemented to assess elaborative
inferencing. Reading time will provide a measure of integration of current information with information that preceded it (e.g., Kintsch, 1988). Previous research has demonstrated that when readers have difficulty integrating current information with previously presented information, reading time slows down (e.g., Albrecht & O'Brien, 1993; O'Brien & Albrecht, 1992; O'Brien & Myers, 1985).

Recognition time will determine whether readers generate a concept representing the predictive inference in the passage they had just read. If readers generate an elaborative inference, they will be faster responding to the concept than if they do not generate an elaborative inference. If readers do not draw elaborative inferences, there should be no difference in recognition times.

Experiment 1

The present experiment was designed to replicate earlier studies and provide evidence that readers draw predictive inferences when restricting context is available at a local level. In Experiment 1, subjects read passages consisting of six sections: an introduction, an elaboration describing two candidates that were either consistent or inconsistent with later critical sentences, context supporting a predictive inference, two critical sentences, and a conclusion. A sample passage has been presented in Table 1. The first few sentences introduce the theme of the passage. The elaboration section described two candidates (e.g., a shortstop and a catcher) in four to six sentences. One candidate's description contained information that was
Table 1 - Example passage from Experiments 1 and 2.

Introduction
Everybody agreed that the Wildcats had more raw talent than any other team in the league. Unfortunately, the Wildcats were in the midst of a long losing streak.

Consistent Elaboration — Appropriate candidate 1st
At least the catcher's attitude and skill seemed unaffected by the losing streak. The catcher had outstanding leadership abilities and was a favorite with the rest of the players. Still, there was animosity building up between the team players. The shortstop had begun criticizing other players each time the team lost a game. Most of the other players did not like the shortstop because he didn't have any team spirit.

Inconsistent Elaboration — Appropriate candidate 1st
At least the shortstop's attitude and skill seemed unaffected by the losing streak. The shortstop had outstanding leadership abilities and was a favorite with the rest of the players. Still, there was animosity building up between the team players. The catcher had begun criticizing other players each time the team lost a game. Most of the other players did not like the catcher because he didn't have any team spirit.

Consistent Elaboration — Appropriate candidate 2nd
In addition, there was animosity building up between the team players. The shortstop had begun criticizing other players each time the team lost a game. Most of the other players did not like the shortstop because he didn't have any team spirit. At least the catcher's attitude and skill seemed unaffected by the losing streak. The catcher had outstanding leadership abilities and was a favorite with the rest of the players.

Inconsistent Elaboration — Appropriate candidate 2nd
In addition, there was animosity building up between the team players. The catcher had begun criticizing other players each time the team lost a game. Most of the other players did not like the catcher because he didn't have any team spirit. At least the shortstop's attitude and skill seemed unaffected by the losing streak. The shortstop had outstanding leadership abilities and was a favorite with the rest of the players.

Character Shift
Morale was especially low following the Wildcats' sixth straight loss. After the game, the manager returned to his office to study a recent game film.

Inference Context
To build morale and divert his team from their current losing streak, the manager wanted to appoint a team captain. The manager knew he had to select a player who was strong and could inspire the other players. The captain had to be the best overall team player. After considering the options, the manager made his choice.

Critical Sentences
He named the catcher the team captain.
The catcher gladly accepted the honor.

Conclusion
In order to psych up his players for the game, the manager delivered a compelling pep talk. After his speech, the Wildcats charged out onto the field.
contextually appropriate with future critical sentences and the other candidate's description contained information that was inappropriate with those sentences. The next section contained two sentences that served to shift the focus from the candidates but continued the theme of the story. Following the shift, three to four sentences described a goal (e.g., the manager had to appoint a team captain) and context restricting the characteristics of the candidate that would appropriately fulfill that goal. This was followed by two critical sentences that were either consistent or inconsistent with the elaboration section (i.e., the catcher was named the team captain, the catcher gladly accepted the honor). Two to three sentences provided a conclusion to the story.

The most interesting sections of the passages involve the elaboration and critical sentences. Consider the sample passage in Table 1. In all versions, the critical sentences stated that the catcher was appointed the team captain. In the "consistent" versions, the catcher was described as a favorite with his teammates and having great skill and leadership abilities while the shortstop was described as critical, lacking in team spirit and not well-liked by his teammates. Readers should not experience difficulty integrating information from the critical sentences with the elaborations when the description of the catcher is consistent with the critical sentences. In the "inconsistent" versions, the descriptions were switched so that the catcher was characterized as critical, lacking team spirit and not well-liked by his teammates and the shortstop was described as a favorite with his teammates, having great skill and leadership.
abilities. Readers should experience difficulty integrating information in the critical sentences with the elaboration when the description of the catcher is inconsistent with the target sentences. Previous research has shown that sentences are read more slowly when they contain inconsistent information (e.g., Albrecht & O'Brien, 1993; Hakala & O'Brien, 1995; McKoon & Ratcliff, 1992; O'Brien & Albrecht, 1992). Thus, it was predicted that the critical sentences would be read more slowly when they were preceded by the inconsistent conditions than the consistent conditions.

**Method**

**Subjects.** Forty University of New Hampshire undergraduates participated for course credit. Subjects were randomly assigned to one of four material sets, with the restriction that each set was read by an equal number of subjects.

**Materials.** A set of 20 passages had been constructed for the experiment. Each passage began with two to three introductory sentences that served to set up the basic theme. The elaboration section described two candidates (e.g., a shortstop and a catcher) in four to six sentences. Each candidate was mentioned twice explicitly and once implicitly. One of the elaborations contained information that was consistent with later critical sentences, whereas the remaining elaboration contained information that was inconsistent with later critical sentences. The next section contained two sentences that served to shift the focus from the candidates but continued the theme of the passage. Following this, the inference context section consisted of three to four sentences that
presented a goal of the protagonist (e.g., the manager had to appoint a team captain) and context that restricted the candidate that served as the more appropriate candidate to fulfill that goal. The context had been written so that it was synonymous with one of the descriptions of the candidate in the elaboration sections. For example, in the consistent elaborations of the sample passage, the catcher is an appropriate candidate to be chosen for team captain. In contrast, in the inconsistent elaborations, the shortstop is a more appropriate candidate for the role. The next section presented two critical sentences that were either consistent or inconsistent with the elaborations (i.e., the catcher was named the team captain, the catcher gladly accepted the honor). The critical sentences varied from 38 to 40 characters in length and were presented on the screen alone. Two to three sentences made up the conclusion and provided an ending to the story.

In addition to the 20 experimental passages, 10 filler passages were added to each material set. These were included to disguise the purpose of the experiment.

**Design.** Passage type (consistent and inconsistent) and candidate order (first and second mentioning) were within subject variables. Four sets of materials had been generated; each set contained 10 consistent passages and 10 inconsistent passages. Within each set, one half of the passages mentioned the appropriate candidate first and the inappropriate candidate second. The remaining half of the passages mentioned the inappropriate candidate first and
the appropriate candidate second. Each passage appeared an equal number of times in each of these four conditions.

Norming Study. To ensure that the inference context section of the passages contained information that clearly made one candidate description better suited to fulfill the goal, a separate set of subjects were asked about their general world knowledge before constructing the passages.

Forty-five students from introductory psychology courses served as subjects. Each subject was given a booklet containing the introduction and the goal of each of the passages, 1 per page (e.g., "Everybody agreed that the Wildcats had more raw talent than any other team in the league. But they were in the midst of a long losing streak. To build morale and divert his team from their current losing streak, the manager wanted to appoint a team captain."). For each passage, subjects were asked to generate five characteristics from general world knowledge that they thought appropriately described a person or event that could fulfill the goal they had just read. In the present example, subjects wrote down characteristics they thought were necessary for a captain of a baseball team. The characteristics generated for each passage were counted.

The two or three most frequent characteristics across all subjects were used in developing the inference context section of the experimental passages.

Procedure. Subjects were randomly assigned to one of the four material sets. Each subject was tested individually. The passages were displayed one line at a time on a video monitor controlled by a Zenith Z100 microcomputer. Each
passage began with the word "Ready" at the center of the display. To read through a passage, the subject pressed a line-advance key. Each key press erased the current line of the passage and displayed the next line. Immediately upon pressing the line-advance key to erase the last line of the passage, a cue (QUESTIONS) was presented for 2000 ms and followed by another cue (????????) for 750 ms. This was followed by a comprehension question about the passage. In response to the question, subjects pressed a "yes" or "no" key. On those trials in which the subject responded incorrectly, the word "ERROR" was presented for 750 ms as feedback. Time to read the critical sentences was recorded.

Results and Discussion

Mean reading times for the critical sentences were recorded and compared. Reading times three standard deviations from the mean were discarded. This eliminated less than 5% of the data for both critical sentences. For all experimental analyses, $E_1$ refers to tests against an error term based on subject variability and $E_2$ refers to tests against an error term based on item variability. All analyses are significant at the .05 level unless otherwise indicated. All planned comparisons used the Bonferroni procedure with a familywise error rate of .05.

Mean reading times for the critical sentences are presented in Table 2. Separate analyses of variance were conducted on the first and second critical sentences. Because the pattern of results did not differ for the sentences, they
Table 2. Reading Times (in Milliseconds) for Critical Sentences as a Function of Elaboration and Position: Experiment 1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Elaboration</th>
<th>Consistent</th>
<th>Inconsistent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sentence 1</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Candidate mentioned 1st</td>
<td>1774</td>
<td>2128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Candidate mentioned 2nd</td>
<td>1719</td>
<td>2131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sentence 2</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Candidate mentioned 1st</td>
<td>1561</td>
<td>1677</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Candidate mentioned 2nd</td>
<td>1572</td>
<td>1667</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
are presented together. Critical sentences were read more slowly when they were preceded by the inconsistent elaboration than the consistent elaboration: $F_1(1, 36) = 55.01$, MSe = 106735.36, $F_2(1, 16) = 38.64$, MSe = 66750.96 (first sentence); $F_1(1, 36) = 15.68$, MSe = 28343.90, $F_2(1, 16) = 9.92$, MSe = 19222.04 (second sentence). No other effects approached significance, $p > .5$.

Planned comparisons confirmed that reading times were longer in the inconsistent elaboration than the consistent elaboration when the appropriate candidate was mentioned first, $t(39) = 5.16$ (first sentence); $t(39) = 2.86$ (second sentence), as well as when the appropriate candidate was mentioned second, $t(39) = 4.52$ (first sentence); $t(39) = 2.43$ (second sentence). Finally, there was no significant difference in reading times for both critical sentences as a function of candidate order, $F_1(1, 36) = .39$, MSe = 71600.98, $F_2(1, 16) = .70$, MSe = 37886.18 (first sentence); $F_1(1, 36) = .00$, MSe 55564.02, $F_2(1, 16) = .08$, MSe = 10766.04 (second sentence).

The current results are consistent with local models of coherence (e.g., Albrecht & O'Brien, 1993; Fletcher & Bloom, 1988; Graesser et al., 1994; McKoon & Ratcliff, 1992). When the elaboration was locally available, subjects took more time to read the critical sentences when they were preceded by the inconsistent elaboration than the consistent elaboration. This finding suggests that subjects had difficulty integrating sentences when they were contradictory with local information.

However, the reading time measure does not determine whether subjects
had drawn a predictive inference following the inference context section. Past research has demonstrated that readers draw predictive inferences when biasing context is locally available (e.g., Gernsbacher et al., 1992; Murray et al., 1993; O'Brien et al., 1988). The purpose of Experiment 2 was to replicate these findings with predictive inferences.

Experiment 2

The purpose of Experiment 2 was to determine whether readers draw predictive inferences when the elaboration was locally available. In Experiment 2, a recognition procedure was used in order to directly test for predictive inferences. Following the presentation of each passage, subjects determined whether a probe word had occurred in the passage. The probe word was always the candidate that was consistent with the inference context section. The probe word was presented either before the inference context or immediately after the inference context. This made up the no-inference and inference conditions, respectively. Thus, if the elaboration provides sufficient contextual support for subjects to draw predictive inferences, then recognition latencies should be faster in the inference condition than the no-inference condition. For example, if subjects infer that the manager has chosen the catcher as the team captain, then they should be faster recognizing "catcher" when probed after the inference context than when probed before the inference context.

Method

Subjects. Forty University of New Hampshire undergraduates participated...
in exchange for course credit. Subjects were randomly assigned to one of four material sets, with the restriction that each set was read by an equal number of subjects.

**Materials.** The materials were the same 20 passages used in Experiment 1 with the following modifications. In Experiment 2, 10 of the inconsistent versions and 10 of the consistent versions of Experiment 1 were eliminated. In addition, the critical sentences and the conclusion of each passage were eliminated. Thus, each passage consisted of an introduction, an elaboration, a character shift section, and an inference context section.

Following each passage, a probe word was presented for a recognition test. The probe word was always the candidate that was consistent with the inference context section. The probe word was presented in one of two locations: either before or after the inference context section. This resulted in the no-inference and inference conditions, respectively.

**Design.** Passage type (no-inference and inference) and candidate order (first and second mentioning) were within subject variables. Four sets of materials had been generated; each set contained 10 no-inference passages and 10 inference passages. Within each set, one half of the passages mentioned the appropriate candidate first and the inappropriate candidate second. The remaining half of the passages mentioned the inappropriate candidate first and the appropriate candidate second. In addition, within each set, the probe word was presented before the inference context section in one
half of the passages and after the inference context section in the remaining half. Each passage appeared an equal number of times in each of these four conditions.

In addition to the 20 experimental passages, 20 filler passages were included for counterbalancing purposes. Each filler passage contained a semantically related foil probe word.

**Procedure.** The procedure for Experiment 2 was the same as Experiment 1 with the following exceptions. After reading the last line of the passage and pressing the line-advance key, a cue (XXX) was presented on the screen for 500 ms followed by the probe word. Subjects were instructed to determine as quickly and as accurately as possible whether that word appeared in the passage they had just read by using the "yes" key if the word occurred in the passage and the "no" key if the word did not appear in the passage. On those trials in which the subject responded incorrectly, the word "ERROR" was presented for 750 ms as feedback. Following the probe word, a cue (QUESTIONS) was presented for 2000 ms and followed by another cue (????????) for 750 ms. This was followed by a comprehension question about the passage. In response to the question, subjects pressed a "yes" or "no" key. On those trials in which the subject responded incorrectly, the word "ERROR" was presented for 750 ms as feedback. Time to respond to the probe word was recorded by the computer.

**Results and Discussion**

Mean recognition times and error rates are presented in Table 3.
Response times that were three standard deviations from the mean were discarded. This eliminated approximately 5% of the data.

Subjects were faster to recognize probe words in the inference condition than in the no inference condition: $F_1(1, 36) = 14.70, MSe = 19034.93; F_2(1, 16) = 6.67, MSe = 11795.89$. This difference was reliable both when the appropriate candidate was mentioned first: $t(39) = 2.97$; and when the appropriate candidate was mentioned second: $t(39) = 3.20$. There was no reliable difference in recognition times as a function of candidate order: $F_1(1, 36) = .81, MSe = 26874.39; F_2(1, 16) = .14, MSe = 22703.04$.

Subjects made more recognition errors in passages that mentioned the candidate first: $F_1(1, 36) = 11.47, MSe = .015; F_2(1, 16) = 10.90, MSe = .008$. This increase in errors occurred both for the no inference conditions, $t(39) = 2.71$ and inference conditions, $t(39) = 2.64$. In addition, subjects made more recognition errors for probe words that followed the inference context; $F_1(1, 36) = 4.30, MSe = .011; F_2(1, 36) = 5.44, MSe = .006$. However, there was no difference in error rates between inference conditions for planned comparisons, $p > .1$. The higher error rate between inference conditions may not be reliable, however, because this finding was not replicated in Experiment 4. Finally, the order x inference interaction was not reliable; $F_1(1, 36) = .35, MSe = .011; F_2(1, 16) = .32, MSe = .006$.

The increased error rates for candidate order may be accounted for by the degree of surface information available to subjects. Subjects may have had
Table 3. Recognition Times (in Milliseconds) and Percent Errors (in Parentheses) for Probe Words as a Function of Elaboration and Position: Experiment 2.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Elaboration</th>
<th>No Inference</th>
<th>Inference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Candidate mentioned 1st</td>
<td>1054(7.5)</td>
<td>963(12.0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Candidate mentioned 2nd</td>
<td>1024(2.0)</td>
<td>947(4.5)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
less surface information available to them when the candidate was mentioned first than when the candidate was mentioned second. That is, when the candidate was mentioned first, subjects may have had to rely primarily on conceptual information when making a recognition decision, whereas when the candidate was mentioned second (i.e., it was more recent), subjects may have relied on both surface and conceptual information when making a decision. This explanation is consistent with the previous results of Jarvella (1971) and Sachs (1967; 1974).

Finally, the current results are consistent with local models of coherence. That is, readers draw predictive inferences when the elaboration is locally available to them. This result is consistent with previous research in elaborative inferencing (e.g., O'Brien et al., 1987). However, Experiments 1 and 2 do not provide a stringent test of the conditions in which readers draw predictive inferences. That is, readers may only draw predictive inferences when the elaboration is available at a local level and not at a global level. This finding would be consistent with the predictions of local coherence models (e.g., Fletcher & Bloom, 1988; van den Broek, 1990) and inconsistent with global coherence models (e.g., Albrecht & O'Brien, 1993; Graesser et al., 1994). The purpose of Experiments 3 and 4 was to determine the effects of the elaboration on predictive inferencing when it was globally available.

Experiment 3

Experiment 3 was designed to replicate and extend the results of
Experiment 1. In the first experiment, subjects took longer to read the critical sentences when they were inconsistent with the locally available elaboration. In Experiment 3, the elaboration was backgrounded so that it was not available at a local level. Thus, the elaboration was not active in memory when the inference context section of the protagonist was encountered. A sample passage has been provided in Table 4.

To background the elaboration, the focus shift section of the passages was extended. Thus, if subjects relied on the elaboration to draw a predictive inference, they would have had to access that information at a global level. Previous research has demonstrated that readers have access to global information even when local coherence is maintained (e.g., Albrecht & O'Brien, 1993). For example, O'Brien (1995; see also Albrecht & O'Brien, 1993) argued that relevant global information resonates with currently processed information. This reactivated information is then treated just like any other active piece of information; readers will attempt to integrate it with currently processed information. Thus, Experiment 3 was designed to determine if subjects experience difficulty integrating the critical sentences with the elaboration when the elaboration was not locally available.

Method

Subjects. Forty University of New Hampshire undergraduates participated in exchange for course credit. Subjects were randomly assigned to one of four material sets, with the restriction that each set was read by an equal number of
subjects.

Materials. The materials were the same 20 passages used in Experiment 1 except that three to five sentences were added to the focus shift section to ensure that the elaboration had been backgrounded prior to the inference context section. This created the background section. The background material did not restate the elaboration but it was related to the general theme of the passage.

Design. The design was the same as Experiment 1.

Procedure. The procedure was the same as in Experiment 1.

Results and Discussion

Mean reading times for the critical sentences were recorded. Reading times that were three standard deviations from the mean were discarded. This eliminated less than 4% of the data for both critical sentences.

Mean reading times for the critical sentences are presented in Table 5. Separate analyses of variance were conducted on the first and second critical sentences. Because the pattern of results did not differ for the sentences, they are presented together. Critical sentences were read more slowly when they were preceded by the inconsistent elaboration than the consistent elaboration: $F_{1}(1, 36) = 27.63, \text{MSe} = 156113.18; F_{2}(1, 16) = 20.44, \text{MSe} = 128921.85$ (first sentence); $F_{1}(1, 36) = 15.26, \text{MSe} = 34013.64; F_{2}(1, 16) = 3.49, \text{MSe} = 43779.13, p = .08$ (second sentence). No other effects approached significance, $p > .3$. 

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
Table 4. Example passage from Experiments 3, 4 and 5.

Introduction
Everybody agreed that the Wildcats had more raw talent than any other team in the league. Unfortunately, the Wildcats were in the midst of a long losing streak.

Consistent Elaboration — Appropriate candidate 1st
At least the catcher’s attitude and skill seemed unaffected by the losing streak. The catcher had outstanding leadership abilities and was a favorite with the rest of the players. Still, there was animosity building up between the team players. The shortstop had begun criticizing other players each time the team lost a game. Most of the other players did not like the shortstop because he didn’t have any team spirit.

Inconsistent Elaboration — Appropriate candidate 1st
At least the shortstop’s attitude and skill seemed unaffected by the losing streak. The shortstop had outstanding leadership abilities and was a favorite with the rest of the players. Still, there was animosity building up between the team players. The catcher had begun criticizing other players each time the team lost a game. Most of the other players did not like the catcher because he didn’t have any team spirit.

Consistent Elaboration — Appropriate candidate 2nd
In addition, there was animosity building up between the team players. The shortstop had begun criticizing other players each time the team lost a game. Most of the other players did not like the shortstop because he didn’t have any team spirit. At least the catcher’s attitude and skill seemed unaffected by the losing streak. The catcher had outstanding leadership abilities and was a favorite with the rest of the players.

Inconsistent Elaboration — Appropriate candidate 2nd
In addition, there was animosity building up between the team players. The catcher had begun criticizing other players each time the team lost a game. Most of the other players did not like the catcher because he didn’t have any team spirit. At least the shortstop’s attitude and skill seemed unaffected by the losing streak. The shortstop had outstanding leadership abilities and was a favorite with the rest of the players.

Background
Morale was especially low following the Wildcats’ sixth straight loss. After the game, the manager returned to his office to study a recent game film. The manager took down extensive notes as he watched the film. Then he carefully planned his team’s strategy for the next game. Before leaving his office, the manager filled out a team roster. Early the following morning, the manager arrived at the stadium.

Inference Context
To build morale and divert his team from their current losing streak, the manager wanted to appoint a team captain. The manager knew he had to select a player who was strong and could inspire the other players. The captain had to be the best overall team player. After considering the options, the manager made his choice.

Critical Sentences
He named the catcher the team captain.
The catcher gladly accepted the honor.

Conclusion
In order to psych up his players for the game, the manager delivered a compelling pep talk. After his speech, the Wildcats charged out onto the field.
Table 5. Reading Times (in Milliseconds) for Critical Sentences as a Function of Elaboration and Position: Experiment 3.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Elaboration</th>
<th>Consistent</th>
<th>Inconsistent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sentence 1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Candidate mentioned 1st</td>
<td>1872</td>
<td>2231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Candidate mentioned 2nd</td>
<td>1853</td>
<td>2150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sentence 2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Candidate mentioned 1st</td>
<td>1575</td>
<td>1682</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Candidate mentioned 2nd</td>
<td>1593</td>
<td>1713</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Planned comparisons confirmed that reading times were longer in the inconsistent elaboration than the consistent elaboration when the appropriate candidate was mentioned first, $t(39) = 4.99$ (first sentence); $t(39) = 2.58$ (second sentence); as well as when the appropriate candidate was mentioned second, $t(39) = 3.65$ (first sentence), and $t(39) = 2.86$ (second sentence). Finally, there was no significant difference in reading times for both critical sentences as a function of candidate order; $F_1(1, 36) = .98$, $MSe = 102985.19$; $F_2(1, 16) = .03$, $MSe = 52198.91$ (first sentence); $F_1(1, 36) = .70$, $MSe = 34924.19$; $F_2(1, 16) = .06$, $MSe = 46902.48$ (second sentence).

The current results are consistent with the predictions of global models of coherence (e.g., Albrecht & O'Brien, 1993; Graesser et al., 1994) and are difficult to reconcile with local models of coherence (e.g., Fletcher & Bloom, 1988; van den Broek, 1990). Reading times for the critical sentences slowed down when preceded by the inconsistent elaboration even though it was available only at a global level and local coherence had been maintained. As previously discussed, the reading time methodology does not indicate whether subjects have actually generated a predictive inference when the elaboration was globally available. Experiment 4 directly tested this.

**Experiment 4**

The motivation for Experiment 4 was to determine whether subjects generated predictive inferences when the elaboration was available only at a global level. To do this, passages from Experiment 3 were tested with a
recognition procedure. As in Experiment 2, a probe word was presented either after the background (i.e., no-inference condition) or after the inference context (i.e., inference condition). If subjects draw predictive inferences at a global level, then response latencies should be faster in the inference condition than the no-inference condition. Such a result would be consistent with global models and inconsistent with local models.

Method

Subjects. Forty University of New Hampshire undergraduates participated in exchange for course credit. Subjects were randomly assigned to one of four material sets, with the restriction that each set was read by an equal number of subjects.

Materials. The materials were the same 20 passages used in Experiment 2 except that the background material from Experiment 3 was added following the elaboration.

Design. The design was the same as in Experiment 2 with one exception. Due to an error in the design in Experiment 4, one half of the subjects did not receive a comprehension question for each passage. I compared their response times to the response times of subjects who received comprehension questions to ensure that there were no pattern differences. The pattern of results were the same and statistical analyses confirmed that there were no differences between the two groups.

Procedure. The procedure was the same as in Experiment 2.
Results and Discussion

Mean recognition times and error rates are presented in Table 6. Response times that were three standard deviations from the mean were discarded. This eliminated less than 7% of the data.

Response times to the candidate concepts were significantly faster when preceded by the inference condition: $F_1(1, 36) = 27.84, \text{MSe} = 15659.44$ than in the no inference condition: $F_2(1, 16) = 27.18, \text{MSe} = 6590.10$. This was true both when the appropriate candidate was mentioned first; $t(39) = 3.44$; and when the appropriate candidate was mentioned second; $t(39) = 3.94$. Finally, order of candidate mentioning did not produce a reliable difference in response times, $F_1(1, 36) = .001, \text{MSe} = 26036.26; F_2(1, 16) = 1.08, \text{MSe} = 8171.68$.

Subjects made more recognition errors in passages that mentioned the candidate first. However, this was true only in an analysis by subjects; $F_1(1, 36) = 5.44, \text{MSe} = .007; F_2(1, 16) = 2.96, \text{MSe} = .006 (p = .104)$. Subjects tended to make more errors when the candidate was mentioned first than when the candidate was mentioned second in the inference conditions, $t(39) = 1.95, p = .058$. There was no reliable difference between order in the no inference conditions, $p > .2$.

Taken together, the results of Experiments 3 and 4 are consistent with global models of coherence (e.g., Albrecht & O'Brien, 1993; Graesser et al., 1994) and are inconsistent with local models of coherence (e.g., Fletcher & Bloom, 1988; van den Broek, 1990). Readers draw predictive inferences when
Table 6. Recognition Times (in Milliseconds) and Percent Errors (in Parentheses) for Probe Words as a Function of Elaboration and Position: Experiment 4.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Elaboration</th>
<th>No Inference</th>
<th>Inference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Candidate mentioned 1st</td>
<td>1077(5.5)</td>
<td>981(7.0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Candidate mentioned 2nd</td>
<td>1085(3.5)</td>
<td>971(3.0)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
the biasing elaboration was available at a global level. However, in order to make this claim, it is critical to demonstrate that the elaboration had been successfully backgrounded by the time the inference context had been presented. The purpose of Experiment 5 was to investigate this issue.

Experiment 5

The goal of Experiment 5 was to ensure that the elaboration was not active in memory following the background section. To test this, a probe word was presented either before or after the background section. If the candidate was successfully backgrounded, then subjects should be faster recognizing the candidate concept when it is presented before the background section than when it is presented after.

Method

Subjects. Forty University of New Hampshire undergraduates participated in exchange for course credit. Subjects were randomly assigned to one of four material sets, with the restriction that each set was read by an equal number of subjects.

Materials and Design. The materials were the same 20 passages used in Experiment 4 except that the probe word was presented either immediately before or after the background section. Thus, the inference context sections had been eliminated in all passages. This resulted in 4 conditions: a background condition when the candidate was mentioned first, a no background condition when the candidate was mentioned first, a background condition when the candidate was mentioned first, a background condition when the
candidate was mentioned second, and a no background condition when the candidate was mentioned second.

Procedure. The procedure is the same as in Experiment 4.

Results and Discussion

Mean recognition times and error rates are presented in Table 7. Response times that were three standard deviations from the mean were discarded. This eliminated less than 4% of the data.

Subjects were faster to recognize candidate concepts when probed before the background section than after the background section, $F_1(1, 36) = 42.88$, $MSe = 28116.50$; $F_2(1, 16) = 22.41$, $MSe = 7288.21$. This was true when the candidate was mentioned first, $t(39) = 4.21$; and when the candidate was mentioned second, $t(39) = 5.29$. Also, subjects recognized the candidate concept faster when it was mentioned second; $F_1(1, 36) = 5.82$, $MSe = 9696.21$; $F_2(1, 16) = 5.58$, $MSe = 5337.82$. However, this occurred only when the candidate concept had not been backgrounded; $t(39) = 2.61$. No other effects approached significance, $p > .1$.

Subjects made more recognition errors in passages that mentioned the candidate first than second: $F_1(1, 36) = 16.13$, $MSe = .008$; $F_2(1, 16) = 6.91$, $MSe = .009$. This increase in errors occurred when the candidate had been both backgrounded, $t(39) = 2.92$ and not backgrounded, $t(39) = 2.50$. No other error rate effects approached significance, $p > .6$.

In sum, there are two primary findings in Experiment 5: First, probe words
Table 7. Recognition Times (inMilliseconds) and Percent Errors (in Parentheses) for Probe Words as a Function of Background and Position: Experiment 5.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Background</th>
<th>Background</th>
<th>No Background</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Candidate mentioned 1st</td>
<td>1061(8.0)</td>
<td>977(7.0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Candidate mentioned 2nd</td>
<td>1050(2.0)</td>
<td>913(2.0)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
were recognized faster when they had not been backgrounded than when they had been backgrounded. This finding indicates that the elaboration was not readily accessible following the background section. Thus, it can be concluded that the elaboration was globally available to subjects when the inference context section was presented in Experiment 4. Second, probe words were recognized faster when they had been mentioned second in the no background condition. The difference between position mentioning in the no background conditions can be attributed to the greater amount of surface information available to subjects when the candidate was mentioned second. This finding is consistent with previous research (e.g., Jarvella, 1971; Sachs, 1967; 1974). Taken together, the results of Experiments 3, 4 and 5 provide evidence that global predictive inferences are made by readers.
VI. GENERAL DISCUSSION

The current set of results replicate and extend previous research on predictive inferencing (e.g., Germsbacher et al., 1992; McKoon & Ratcliff, 1981; Murray et al., 1993; O'Brien et al., 1988; Singer & Ferreira, 1983) by further specifying the conditions under which readers generate predictive inferences. The general finding has been that readers do not generate predictive inferences (e.g., Corbett & Dosher, 1978; Duffy, 1986; McKoon & Ratcliff, 1986a, Potts et al., 1988; Singer, 1979; Singer & Ferreira, 1983). The primary reason readers do not draw predictive inferences is that they require a great deal of effort to generate and the probability that the reader will generate the correct inference is low (Graesser & Clark, 1985; Johnson-Laird, 1983; Kintsch, 1988; Potts et al., 1988). However, there is some evidence that when there is a sufficiently biasing context which reduces the likelihood of generating an incorrect inference, readers will generate a predictive inference (e.g., Garrod et al., 1990; Keefe & McDaniel, 1993; Murray et al., 1993; O'Brien et al., 1988). The current set of experiments extend this finding by demonstrating that readers generate predictive inferences when biasing contextual information is available at either local or global levels.

Currently, the conditions in which readers use contextual information to draw predictive inferences is under debate. Local models of coherence propose that readers only draw predictive inferences when currently active information contains context constraining the predictive inference. Furthermore, as long as
local coherence is maintained, readers do not search inactive (i.e., global) portions of the memory representation for biasing context (e.g., Fletcher & Bloom, 1988; van den Broek, 1990). For example, according to the current-state selection strategy, inferential connections are established between currently processed information and information in active memory. Readers hold the most recent causal antecedent without a consequence in active memory because it is likely to provide a connection with incoming information. Similarly, the causal inference maker predicts that readers focus on establishing inferential connections between pieces of information that co-occur in active memory. Global connections are made only when a local causal antecedent is not available or it does not provide a sufficient explanation for a currently read consequence.

Thus, both the current-state selection strategy and the causal inference maker can only account for the generation of a predictive inference if strong biasing context is available at a local level. Experiments 1 and 2 were designed to determine whether readers draw predictive inferences when biasing context was locally available. In Experiment 1, subjects read sentences more slowly when they contained information that was inconsistent with a locally available elaboration than when they read sentences that were consistent with a locally available elaboration. That is, subjects had more difficulty integrating information from sentences (e.g., "The catcher was appointed as the team captain") when they were inconsistent with the elaboration (e.g., "... most players did not like the
catcher because he didn’t have any team spirit.”) than when they were consistent (e.g., “The catcher had outstanding leadership abilities and was a favorite with the rest of the players.”). Experiment 2 demonstrated that when the elaboration biased the outcome of the predictive inference and was locally available, readers activated a concept (e.g., “catcher”) that represented the predictive inference (e.g., the catcher was appointed team captain). The combined results of Experiments 1 and 2 suggest that readers generate predictive inferences when a biasing context is available at a local level.

The current-state selection strategy and the causal inference maker also predict that as long as local coherence is maintained, readers do not reactivate backgrounded portions of the text. However, as demonstrated in Experiments 3 and 4, readers accessed global information even when local coherence had been maintained. In Experiment 3, the elaboration was backgrounded so that it was available only at a global level. Despite this change, readers still experienced comprehension difficulty. Experiment 4 confirmed that readers were indeed reactivating the elaboration at a global level and using that to generate a predictive inference. Taken together, these results suggest that readers generated predictive inferences by accessing the elaboration when it was available at a global level. Experiment 5 provided further support for the view that the information in the elaboration was being reactivated by demonstrating that the information had not been active following the background section. Thus, if readers had adopted any sort of local coherence strategy, they would not have
generated a predictive inference; the biasing context necessary to support such an inference would not have been available in active memory.

That predictive inferences were generated when biasing context was available only at a global level is consistent with the view that readers have access to information at both local and global levels. This finding is consistent with both the constructionist model and the resonance model. According to the constructionist model, readers are guided by the "search-after-meaning" principle (Graesser et al., 1994; Singer et al., 1994). Presumably, the search for meaning is a strategic process in which the reader actively searches active and inactive portions of the discourse model as well as general world knowledge for meaning. In the current experiments, when the elaboration restricted the candidate (i.e., the catcher or shortstop) that served as the more appropriate candidate to fulfill a goal (e.g. the manager had to appoint a team captain), subjects predicted that it would be fulfilled by the appropriate candidate. Presumably, this occurred because subjects had reactivated the elaboration during their search for meaning. Because the elaboration restricted the outcome of the predictive inference, readers generated predictive inferences.

Although the current results fit within the constructionist position, the manner in which the search proceeds in not well specified nor are there any constraints on how much information a reader will access in order to satisfy the search after meaning principle. Given that Graesser et al. fail to specify how readers reactivate global information, the constructionist model becomes difficult
to test.

Alternatively, according to the resonance model, global information is accessed via a fast-acting, passive resonance process. Within this framework, currently processed information serves as a signal to all of memory. Backgrounded relevant information (i.e., information that shares featural overlap with currently processed information) as well as general world knowledge resonate in response to this signal. If there is sufficient featural overlap, the backgrounded information is reactivated and treated just like any active piece of information. That is, the reader attempts to integrate it with currently processed information and on occasion, may use that information to draw predictions about future events. For example, reconsider the example passage from Experiment 4. Presumably, currently processed information (e.g., The manager knew he had to select a player who was strong and could inspire the other players) resonated with relevant backgrounded information in the elaboration (e.g., The catcher/shortstop had outstanding leadership abilities and was a favorite with the rest of the players). Once the information in the elaboration was reactivated, readers could use it to generate a predictive inference.

It is important to note that the resonance model only provides a mechanism for the activation of global information; it does not make any predictions how the reader uses that information during the integration phase. Recently, O'Brien (1995; see also Rizzella & O'Brien, in press) incorporated the resonance model with McKoon and Ratcliff's (1992) minimalist hypothesis. As
described earlier, a tenet of the minimalist hypothesis is that only those inferences necessary for local coherence are fully encoded. Predictive inferences and inferences necessary for global coherence are not fully encoded. For example, McKoon and Ratcliff (1986b) found that when subjects read sentences such as, "The director and the cameraman were ready to shoot close-ups when suddenly the actress fell from the 14th story," they found some evidence that the elaborative concept "dead" had been partially activated. McKoon and Ratcliff argued that these results provided evidence that some features of the predictive inferences were activated.

McKoon and Ratcliff's (1986b) results fit nicely within the resonance model. Presumably, the predictive inference was minimally encoded because the resonance signal between the context of falling from a 14th story and the concept "dead" was weak. However, with additional context, more features associated with the predictive inference would resonate. This in turn would activate more features of the concept "dead" thereby increasing the likelihood that it would be activated. Thus, the resonance model amends the minimalist hypothesis by predicting that predictive inferences and inferences necessary for the maintenance of global coherence are drawn when based on easily available information. According to resonance, inferences based on easily available information are those that have a great degree of featural overlap with currently being processed information.
Encoding of Predictive Inferences

One distinction that should be made is the difference between a fully encoded inference and a partially encoded inference (i.e., information that has not been explicitly stated in the text). These experiments demonstrated that a biasing context results at least in the partial encoding of predictive inferences. That is, context activated concepts comprising the inference and not the actual inference itself. In fact, previous work with predictive inferences has demonstrated that predictive inferential concepts are only tenuously encoded and deteriorate quickly (e.g., Keefe & McDaniel, 1993; Murray et al., 1993). Thus, one goal of future research should be to determine whether predictive inferences are fully encoded and if so, the conditions in which this process occurs.

One way to investigate this possibility is to background a predictive inference with subsequent text followed by a sentence that primes the predictive inference (e.g., "The team captain got up to bat"). If readers encode predictive inferences, then the predictive inference should be stored with related information in memory (see Ratcliff & McKoon, 1979; see also Dell et al., 1983; McKoon & Ratcliff, 1980; van den Broek & Lorch, 1993). If correct, then the priming sentence should facilitate recognition time of the inferred information. Such a result would provide more evidence that readers had encoded predictive inferences as part of their memory representations.
Conclusion

In conclusion, the results of the current experiments cannot be easily reconciled within local coherence models. These models predict that readers focus on the most recent information when drawing predictive inferences. In contrast, the results can be nicely accounted for by global coherence models. Global models predict that readers focus on both relevant information no longer active in working memory as well as recent information when drawing predictive inferences. Future research should determine whether predictive inferences are actually incorporated into the final memory representation and are not just partially encoded. By doing so, we will have a better understanding of the inferential process which in turn will lead to a better understanding of the reading process.
References


Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.


Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.


Appendix A

The passages from Experiments 1 and 2 are presented below. The critical sentences and conclusion sections were eliminated in Experiment 2.
Introduction
Everybody agreed that the Wildcats had more raw talent than any other team in the league. Unfortunately, the Wildcats were in the midst of a long losing streak. In addition, there was animosity building up between the team players.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
At least the catcher's attitude and skill seemed unaffected by the losing streak. The catcher had outstanding leadership abilities and was a favorite with the rest of the players. Still, there was animosity building up between the team players. The shortstop had begun criticizing other players each time the team lost a game. Most of the other players did not like the shortstop because he didn't have any team spirit.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
At least the shortstop's attitude and skill seemed unaffected by the losing streak. The shortstop had outstanding leadership abilities and was a favorite with the rest of the players. Still, there was animosity building up between the team players. The catcher had begun criticizing other players each time the team lost a game. Most of the other players did not like the catcher because he didn't have any team spirit.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
In addition, there was animosity building up between the team players. The shortstop had begun criticizing other players each time the team lost a game. Most of the other players did not like the shortstop because he didn't have any team spirit. At least the catcher's attitude and skill seemed unaffected by the losing streak. The catcher had outstanding leadership abilities and was a favorite with the rest of the players.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
In addition, there was animosity building up between the team players. The catcher had begun criticizing other players each time the team lost a game. Most of the other players did not like the catcher because he didn't have any team spirit. At least the shortstop's attitude and skill seemed unaffected by the losing streak. The shortstop had outstanding leadership abilities and was a favorite with the rest of the players.

Character Shift
Morale was especially low following the Wildcats' sixth straight loss. After the game, the manager returned to his office to study a recent game film.

Inference Context
To build morale and divert his team from their current losing streak, the manager wanted to appoint a team captain. The manager knew he had to select a player who was strong and could inspire the other players. The captain had to be the best overall team player. After considering the options, the manager made his choice.

Critical Sentences
He named the catcher the team captain. The catcher gladly accepted the honor.

Conclusion
In order to psych up his players for the game, the manager delivered a compelling pep talk. After his speech, the Wildcats charged out onto the field.
Introduction
Eddie had been in prison for five years and decided it was time to break out. One day during the daily recreational period, Eddie saw an opportunity to get away. He ran down a corridor leading to a nearby exit and peered around the corner to see if anyone was there.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
He saw the slight and frail desk guard doing some paperwork in his office. The guard was getting old and was supposed to retire the following year. Then Eddie looked down the other end of the hallway. Eddie saw the warden sitting and reading a newspaper. The warden was fierce and Eddie knew he would be overmatched by the big and burly man.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
He saw the slight and frail warden doing some paperwork in his office. The warden was getting old and was supposed to retire the following year. Then Eddie looked down the other end of the hallway. Eddie saw the guard sitting and reading a newspaper. The guard was fierce and Eddie knew he would be overmatched by the big and burly man.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
Eddie saw the warden sitting and reading a newspaper. The warden was fierce and Eddie knew he would be overmatched by the big and burly man. Then Eddie looked down the other end of the hallway. He saw the slight and frail desk guard doing some paperwork in his office. The guard was getting old and was supposed to retire the following year.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
Eddie saw the desk guard sitting and reading a newspaper. The guard was fierce and Eddie knew he would be overmatched by the big and burly man. Then Eddie looked down the other end of the hallway. He saw the slight and frail warden doing some paperwork in his office. The warden was getting old and was supposed to retire the following year.

Character Shift
Then Eddie went over his escape plan in his head. He was glad that he had been able to steal the floorplans of the prison. Then

Inference Context
In order to make his escape proceed smoothly, Eddie looked for a hostage. Because he didn't have any weapons, Eddie knew he should choose a hostage who was weaker and smaller than himself. He looked down each end of the hallway again and decided who he would take for a hostage.

Critical Sentences
Eddie grabbed the guard for a hostage.
He quickly warned the guard to be quiet.

Conclusion
Then Eddie moved down the stairs with his hostage. As they reached the last step, Eddie saw the door that would lead to his freedom.
Introduction
Mrs. Hall was throwing a big birthday party for her little five-year old son. She decided to go to a party store to get some ideas. Mrs. Hall liked this party store because they had so many things to offer such as live entertainment.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
Mrs. Hall entered the store, she was greeted by a jolly clown wearing adorable make-up. He was amusing some children by telling them jokes. The children giggled during the clown’s silly act. Then Mrs. Hall walked down one of the store aisles. She saw a magician wearing scary make-up. She shivered when he cackled at her. Mrs. Hall thought that little children would be very frightened of the magician.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
As Mrs. Hall entered the store, she was greeted by a jolly magician wearing adorable make-up. He was amusing some children by telling them jokes. The children giggled during the magician’s silly act. Then Mrs. Hall walked down one of the store aisles. She saw a clown wearing scary make-up. She shivered when he cackled at her. Mrs. Hall thought that little children would be very frightened of the clown.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
As Mrs. Hall entered the store, she was greeted by a magician who was wearing scary make-up. She shivered when he cackled at her. Mrs. Hall thought that little children would be very frightened of the magician. Then Mrs. Hall walked down one of the store aisles where she saw a jolly clown wearing adorable make-up. He was amusing some children by telling them jokes. The children giggled during the clown’s silly act.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
As Mrs. Hall entered the store, she was greeted by a clown who was wearing scary make-up. She shivered when he cackled at her. Mrs. Hall thought that little children would be very frightened of the clown. Then Mrs. Hall walked down one of the store aisles where she saw a jolly magician wearing adorable make-up. He was amusing some children by telling them jokes. The children giggled during the magician’s silly act.

Character Shift
Mrs. Hall went down another store aisle to buy some party favors. After she finished looking around, Mrs. Hall brought the things she wanted to the cashier.

Inference Context
Mrs. Hall told the cashier she wanted to hire one of the store’s entertainers for a birthday party. Mrs. Hall wanted an entertainer her young son would like. She knew that the entertainer should be funny and love interacting with small kids. Based on her observation at the party store, Mrs. Hall made a decision on who she should hire.

Critical Sentences
Mrs. Hall hired the clown for the party.
She knew the clown would be a success.

Conclusion
Then Mrs. Hall walked out of the store. She got in her car and drove to the mall to buy her son another birthday present.
Introduction
It was the holiday season and Dave was in the mall Christmas shopping. As he was going by the
different stores, he passed a pet shop. He thought it might be fun to look at the animals. Dave
entered the shop and saw a number of dog cages.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
One cage held a friendly spaniel that happily wagged its tail as Dave peered into the cage. The
shop owner told Dave that the spaniel was gentle and good-natured. When Dave looked into
another cage, he saw a vicious poodle that snarled and snapped aggressively at him. The shop
owner said that the poodle had once been mistreated and warned Dave not to put his hand near
the cage because it would bite him.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
One cage held a friendly poodle that happily wagged its tail as Dave peered into the cage. The
shop owner told Dave that the poodle was gentle and good-natured. When Dave looked into
another cage, he saw a vicious spaniel that snarled and snapped aggressively at him. The shop
owner said that the spaniel had once been mistreated and warned Dave not to put his hand near
the cage because it would bite him.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
When Dave looked into one cage, he saw a vicious poodle that snarled and snapped aggressively
at him. The shop owner said that the poodle had once been mistreated and warned Dave not to put
his hand near the cage because it would bite him. Then Dave looked in another cage which held a
friendly spaniel that happily wagged its tail as Dave peered into the cage. The shop owner told
Dave that the spaniel was gentle and good-natured.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
When Dave looked into one cage, he saw a vicious spaniel that snarled and snapped aggressively
at him. The shop owner said that the spaniel had once been mistreated and warned Dave not to put
his hand near the cage because it would bite him. Then Dave looked in another cage which held a
friendly poodle that happily wagged its tail as Dave peered into the cage. The shop owner
told Dave that the poodle was gentle and good-natured.

Character Shift
Then Dave strolled over to the birds and saw a bright red parrot perched on a small tree branch.
He laughed when the bird said hello.

Inference Context
When Dave finished feeding the parrot, he decided to buy a dog for his son. Because his son was
young, Dave thought he should pick out a dog which was docile and easy going. It was also
important that he chose a playful dog for his son. After scanning the dog cages again, Dave
decided what dog to buy.

Critical Sentences
Dave decided to buy his son the spaniel.
He thought it would be a nice surprise.

Conclusion
Dave cheerfully walked out of the shop. He hoped that all of his Christmas shopping would be this
easy.
Introduction
The old king had ruled over the land for the past twenty-five years. Throughout his reign, he had enjoyed being popular with his subjects.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
However, the king had not always been so popular. The people had become disenchanted with the king when he appointed the prince to his court. The prince was clever but not concerned with the well-being of the kingdom. People thought that he was deceitful and out to steal the throne from the king. Nevertheless, the king's popularity had surged with the arrival of the duke. The people were proud to have such a kind and good fellow in the kingdom. The duke often visited the people to give them money and food.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
However, the king had not always been so popular. The people had become disenchanted with the king when he appointed the duke to his court. The duke was clever but not concerned with the well-being of the kingdom. People thought that he was deceitful and out to steal the throne from the king. Nevertheless, the king's popularity had surged with the arrival of the prince. The people were proud to have such a kind and good fellow in the kingdom. The prince often visited the people to give them money and food.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
The king's popularity had surged with the arrival of the duke. The people were proud to have such a kind and good fellow in the kingdom. The duke often visited the people to give them money and food. However, the king had not always been so popular. The people had become disenchanted with the king when he appointed the prince to his court. The prince was clever but not concerned with the well-being of the kingdom. People thought that he was deceitful and out to steal the throne from the king.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
The king's popularity had surged with the arrival of the prince. The people were proud to have such a kind and good fellow in the kingdom. The prince often visited the people to give them money and food. However, the king had not always been so popular. The people had become disenchanted with the king when he appointed the duke to his court. The duke was clever but not concerned with the well-being of the kingdom. People thought that he was deceitful and out to steal the throne from the king.

Character Shift
This evening the king was having a huge banquet. However, before the feast the king was informed that top secret information was being leaked to an enemy country.

Inference Context
In order to maintain the safety of the kingdom, the king knew he had to catch the spy. In order for the spy to have gotten secret information, the king knew that the spy must be intelligent and sneaky. Because the king reasoned that the spy must be someone he knew, he quickly figured out who the spy was.

Critical Sentences
He accused the prince of being the spy.
The prince was locked up in the tower.

Conclusion
Now that the incident had been resolved, the king was determined to enjoy himself at the feast. He was relieved that his kingdom was safe from harm.
The end of spring semester was rapidly approaching. This was the dean's favorite time of the year because she enjoyed watching the university's seniors graduate. Currently, the dean was in her office looking at a list of famous alumni.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
One alumni was a famous politician who was well known his eloquent communication skills. It was clear to the dean that the politician was wise and articulate. Then the dean continued looking over her list. She came across the name of a well-known writer who had previously been involved in a scandalous affair. The dean's impression was that the writer did not handle the situation well with the media because he did not know how to communicate to the public.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
One alumni was a famous writer who was well known for his eloquent communication skills. It was clear to the dean that the writer was wise and articulate. Then the dean continued looking over her list. She came across the name of a well-known politician who had previously been involved in a scandalous affair. The dean's impression was that the politician did not handle the situation well with the media because he did not know how to communicate to the public.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
She came across the name of a well-known politician who had previously been involved in a scandalous affair. The dean's impression was that the politician did not handle the situation well with the media because he did not know how to communicate to the public. Then the dean continued looking over her list. Another alumni was a famous writer who was well known for his eloquent communication skills. It was clear to the dean that the writer was wise and articulate.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
She came across the name of a well-known politician who had previously been involved in a scandalous affair. The dean's impression was that the politician did not handle the situation well with the media because he did not know how to communicate to the public. Then the dean continued looking over her list. Another alumni was a famous writer who was well known for his eloquent communication skills. It was clear to the dean that the writer was wise and articulate.

Character Shift
After perusing the alumni list, the dean had to attend a meeting and she did not want to be late. The meeting was concluded in two hours and the dean returned to her office.

Inference Context
Because graduation was approaching, the dean needed to find a commencement speaker. She looked for some ideas from the alumni list. Because the commencement speech could have a big impact on the graduating class, the dean planned to ask an alumnus who was intelligent and well spoken. She looked over the list of alumni again and then made a choice.

Critical Sentences
The dean decided to ask the politician.
She hoped that he would give the speech.

Conclusion
The dean made the necessary phone calls. She was informed that she would receive a decision regarding the commencement speaker in a few days.
Introduction
Sheila was the lead singer of a local rock band. She was excited because the band had an audition for a record company.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
The guitarist of the band had practiced extensively for the audition. Sheila had never seen him so self assured. She thought the guitarist was gifted and had the most artistic skill in the band. Unfortunately, Sheila didn't think the band's new drummer would pan out. The drummer often made mistakes and experienced stage fright.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
The drummer of the band had practiced extensively for the audition. Sheila had never seen him so self assured. She thought the drummer was gifted and had the most artistic skill in the band. Unfortunately, Sheila didn't think the band's new guitarist would pan out. The guitarist often made mistakes and experienced stage fright. The band had to cover up for him during these moments.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
Unfortunately, Sheila didn't think the band's new drummer would pan out. The guitarist often made mistakes and experienced stage fright. The band had to cover up for him during these moments. She was glad that the drummer had practiced extensively for the audition. Sheila had never seen him so self assured. She thought the drummer was gifted and had the most artistic skill in the band.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
Unfortunately, Sheila didn't think the band's new guitarist would pan out. The drummer often made mistakes and experienced stage fright. The band had to cover up for him during these moments. She was glad that the guitarist had practiced extensively for the audition. Sheila had never seen him so self assured. She thought the guitarist was gifted and had the most artistic skill in the band.

Character Shift
Sheila got the band members together to practice a song she had finished writing. They sounded great and Sheila knew they were ready for the audition.

Inference Context
Because Sheila wanted to impress the record producer during the audition, she planned to have a band member do a solo during the song. In order for the solo to go well, she had to choose the band's most talented and confident musician to do it. Sheila knew there was only one member of the band who fulfilled these requirements.

Critical Sentences
She asked the guitarist to do the solo.
Sheila thought he would play perfectly.

Conclusion
After several hours of practice, the band took a well deserved break. They were excited about the audition and talked about it for the remainder of the afternoon.
Introduction
It was football preseason and the coach of the Eagles was preparing his team for a solid season.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
Unfortunately, one of the team's quarterbacks was playing terribly during practice. He lacked team spirit and didn't work hard to develop the expertise necessary for playing football. In fact, the quarterback hadn't seen any playing time in two years. However, the Eagles were excited about their all-state receiver who had spent three years with the team. The receiver was considered to have the most talent in the league. The other players were proud to have him on the team.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
Unfortunately, one of the team's receivers was playing terribly during practice. He lacked team spirit and didn't work hard to develop the expertise necessary for playing football. In fact, the receiver hadn't seen any playing time in two years. However, the Eagles were excited about their all-state quarterback who had spent three years with the team. The quarterback was considered to have the most talent in the league. The other players were proud to have him on the team.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
The Eagles were excited about their all-state receiver who had spent three years with the team. The receiver was considered to have the most talent in the league. The other players were proud to have him on the team. Unfortunately, one of the team's quarterbacks was playing terribly during practice. He lacked team spirit and didn't work hard to develop the expertise necessary for playing football. In fact, the quarterback hadn't seen any playing time in two years.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
The Eagles were excited about their all-state quarterback who had spent three years with the team. The quarterback was considered to have the most talent in the league. The other players were proud to have him on the team. Unfortunately, one of the team's receivers was playing terribly during practice. He lacked team spirit and didn't work hard to develop the expertise necessary for playing football. In fact, the receiver hadn't seen any playing time in two years.

Character Shift
Few practice sessions were left so the coach made the most of them. The Eagles were playing their first season in a new stadium and he wanted the team to be familiar with the new turf.

Inference Context
At the moment, the coach had to cut one more player from the Eagles because there were too many players on the team. This meant he had to cut the team's least skilled player. It was critical that he keep his best player and cut the player who was lazy and unsportsmanlike. Without any hesitation, the coach made his choice.

Critical Sentences
He cut the quarterback from the Eagles.
He thought this was the best decision.

Conclusion
The coach planned to use the second string quarterback because he was playing well. The coach hoped to work with him in order to get him in shape for the Eagle's first season game.
Introduction
The crew on the luxury liner was preparing for its weekly cruise. After completing a final inspection, the captain gave the orders for the ship to set course for Aruba. Several hours after departing, several passengers stopped by the ship's hospitality office to provide some written comments about the crew.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
The captain was dismayed to see that the passengers complained about the purser's shifty behavior. Many passengers said they did not trust the purser because he looked dishonest and had been observed lurking by the cabins. However, the captain was not at all surprised to see the glowing remarks written about the ship's cruise director. Not only had the director been with the same cruise line for over six years, but she was always trusted by the passengers.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
The captain was dismayed to see that the passengers complained about the cruise director's shifty behavior. Many passengers said they did not trust the director because she looked dishonest and had been observed lurking by the cabins. However, the captain was not at all surprised to see the glowing remarks written about the ship's purser. Not only had the purser been with the same cruise line for over six years, but he was always trusted by the passengers.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
The captain was not at all surprised to see the glowing remarks written about the ship's cruise director. Not only had the director been with the same cruise line for over six years, but she was always trusted by the passengers. However, the captain was dismayed to hear that the passengers complained about the purser's shifty behavior. Many passengers said they did not trust the purser because he looked dishonest and had been observed lurking by the cabins.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
The captain was not at all surprised to see the glowing remarks written about the ship's purser. Not only had the purser been with the same cruise line for over six years, but he was always trusted by the passengers. However, the captain was dismayed to hear that the passengers complained about the cruise director's shifty behavior. Many passengers said they did not trust the director because she looked dishonest and had been observed lurking by the cabins.

Character Shift
The captain finished reading the comments and headed for the deck. As the captain was thinking, he was approached by two passengers who said that their jewelry had been stolen from their rooms.

Inference Context
In order to maintain order on the ship, the captain wanted to nab the thief quickly. He had a hunch that the thief was a ship employee. In addition, the captain reasoned that the thief must be deceptive and sly in order to steal valuables. After conducting a thorough investigation, the captain determined the identity of the thief.

Critical Sentences
He accused the purser of the burglaries.
The purser was locked away in a cabin.

Conclusion
The captain planned to drop the culprit off at the closest port. The remainder of the trip was uneventful.
Introduction
Claremont Hospital was situated in one of the poorest sections of the city and was designed to help those who couldn't afford health care. Because of reduced government funding, the hospital could only employ a small number of staff.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
Because the hospital couldn't afford to pay high salaries, it recently had to hire an inexperienced doctor. He had made several thoughtless mistakes which had affected the recovery of several patients. The hospital couldn't lose the doctor because the hospital was already understaffed. Fortunately, some of the staff was dedicated to practicing good medicine. The hospital's head nurse was very skilled and happily spent the past ten years at Claremont. She had acquired extensive experience during those years. As a result, the hospital considered the nurse very knowledgeable and responsible.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
Because the hospital couldn't afford to pay high salaries, it recently had to hire an inexperienced nurse. She had made several thoughtless mistakes which had affected the recovery of several patients. The hospital couldn't lose the nurse because the hospital was already understaffed. Fortunately, some of the staff was dedicated to practicing good medicine. The hospital's doctor was very skilled and happily spent the past ten years at Claremont. He had acquired extensive experience during those years. As a result, the hospital considered the doctor very knowledgeable and responsible.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
Fortunately, some of the staff was dedicated to practicing good medicine. The hospital's head nurse was very skilled and happily spent the past ten years at Claremont. She had acquired extensive experience during those years. As a result, the hospital considered the nurse very knowledgeable and responsible. Still, because the hospital couldn't afford to pay high salaries, it recently had to hire an inexperienced doctor. He had made several thoughtless mistakes which had affected the recovery of several patients. The hospital couldn't lose the doctor because the hospital was already understaffed.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
Fortunately, some of the staff was dedicated to practicing good medicine. The hospital's doctor was very skilled and happily spent the past ten years at Claremont. He had acquired extensive experience during those years. As a result, the hospital considered the doctor very knowledgeable and responsible. Still, because the hospital couldn't afford to pay high salaries, it recently had to hire an inexperienced nurse. She had made several thoughtless mistakes which had affected the recovery of several patients. The hospital couldn't lose the nurse because the hospital was already understaffed.

Character Shift
Claremont Hospital was run by a well respected health director. However, Claremont was currently under investigation because one of its patients had recently died from human error.

Inference Context
In order to maintain the medical services to the people, the health director was determined to find the hospital employee responsible for the error. From past experience, the director thought that the individual who was responsible for the death was likely to be careless and lacking medical knowledge. The director investigated the situation and quickly found out who was responsible.

Critical Sentences
The doctor was the cause of the death.
The doctor had to face a review board.

Conclusion
The health director informed the doctor that he had to take a leave of absence from the hospital. The health director hoped that he could find a replacement soon.
Introduction
Cafe La Rive was one of the most popular restaurants in the summer town of Mastic Beach. The owner of Cafe La Rive found that she was busiest during summer because it was tourist season.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
Recently, customers started complaining about the restaurant's waiter because he slacked off during the job. The waiter was often late coming to take the customer's orders, which left many of them disgruntled. Nevertheless, many of the customers were fond of the hostess. The hostess was respectful to the customers and performed her job exceedingly well.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
Recently, customers started complaining about the restaurant's hostess because she slacked off during the job. The hostess was often late coming to seat the customers, which left many of them disgruntled. Nevertheless, many of the customers were fond of the waiter. The waiter was respectful to the customers and performed his job exceedingly well.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
Many of the customers were fond of the restaurant's hostess. The hostess was respectful to the customers and performed her job exceedingly well. However, customers started complaining about the waiter because he slacked off during the job. The waiter was often late coming to take the customer's orders, which left many of them disgruntled.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
Many of the customers were fond of the restaurant's waiter. The waiter was respectful to the customers and performed his job exceedingly well. However, customers started complaining about the hostess because she slacked off during the job. The hostess was often late seating the customers, which left many of them disgruntled.

Character Shift
This afternoon, the owner decided to spend some time balancing her books. She was a little dismayed that business had not been as good that summer.

Inference Context
In order to cut back on expenses, the owner planned to lay off one of her employees. For the good of the restaurant, she thought she should lay off the employee who the customers thought was lazy and did not care for. After thinking about the performances of her employees, the owner made a decision on who she would fire.

Critical Sentences
The owner decided to lay off the waiter.
She thought this was the best decision.

Conclusion
Because she was tired from work, the owner got in her car and drove home. She was looking forward to spending a relaxing evening with her husband.
Introduction
It was Saturday morning and Tim was glad that he had the day off. He spent the morning making pancakes for himself.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
After eating breakfast, Tim remembered that there was a great picnic that afternoon. Tim was excited about the picnic because there would be plenty of good food and friends. He thought it would be a fun way to spend the afternoon. Suddenly, Tim realized that his neighbors had invited him to a party that afternoon too. He thought that the party would be boring because he wouldn't know anyone well and was uncomfortable in new situations. Because Tim had a hard time talking to strangers, he thought he would not have a good time there.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
After eating breakfast, Tim remembered that there was a great party that afternoon. Tim was excited about the party because there would be plenty of good food and friends. He thought it would be a fun way to spend the afternoon. Suddenly, Tim realized that his neighbors had invited him to a picnic that afternoon too. He thought that the picnic would be boring because he wouldn't know anyone well and was uncomfortable in new situations. Because Tim had a hard time talking to strangers, he thought he would not have a good time there.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
After eating breakfast, Tim remembered that his neighbors had invited him to a party that afternoon. He thought that the party would be boring because he wouldn't know anyone well and was uncomfortable in new situations. Because Tim had a hard time talking to strangers, he thought he would not have a good time there. Then Tim realized that there was a great picnic that afternoon too. Tim was excited about the picnic because there would be plenty of good food and friends. He thought it would be a fun way to spend the afternoon.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
Tim remembered that his neighbors had invited him to a picnic that afternoon. He thought that the picnic would be boring because he wouldn't know anyone well and was uncomfortable in new situations. Because Tim had a hard time talking to strangers, he thought he would not have a good time there. Then Tim realized that there was a great party that afternoon too. Tim was excited about the party because there would be plenty of good food and friends. He thought it would be a fun way to spend the afternoon.

Character Shift
After finishing his pancakes, Tim decided to clear off the table. Then he washed and dried the dishes and put them away in the cupboard.

Inference Context
Because he had the afternoon off, Tim wanted to find something to do. It was important for him to do something that he would enjoy because he rarely had time off. Tim liked to spend his free time with people he knew he would have fun with. After thinking for a minute, Tim decided how he would spend his afternoon.

Critical Sentences
Tim decided he would go to the picnic.
He grabbed his keys and shut the door.

Conclusion
Tim started his car and drove off. He was looking forward to the fun he would be having that afternoon.
Country-Market was a small grocery store in a little country town. Because of its size, the market had few employees. In addition, most of the local kids had to work on the family farms so the selection of potential employees was limited.

The store’s cashier was diligent and punctual. She never missed a day of work and was always cheerful with the customers. The owner of Country-Market never had to worry about leaving the store because the cashier could take care of things. Unfortunately, the stockboy was not very much help. He was lazy and often showed up late for work. Although the owner had reprimanded the stockboy for such problems, it didn’t seem to do any good.

The store’s stockboy was diligent and punctual. He never missed a day of work and was always cheerful with the customers. The owner of Country-Market never had to worry about leaving the store because the stockboy could take care of things. Unfortunately, the cashier was not very much help. She was lazy and often showed up late for work. Although the owner had reprimanded the cashier for such problems, it didn’t seem to do any good.

Unfortunately, the store’s stockboy was not very much help. He was lazy and often showed up late for work. Although the owner had reprimanded the stockboy for such problems, it didn’t seem to do any good. However, the cashier was diligent and punctual. She never missed a day of work and was always cheerful with the customers. The owner of Country-Market never had to worry about leaving the store because the cashier could take care of things.

Unfortunately, the store’s cashier was not very much help. She was lazy and often showed up late for work. Although the owner had reprimanded the cashier for such problems, it didn’t seem to do any good. However, the stockboy was diligent and punctual. He never missed a day of work and was always cheerful with the customers. The owner of Country-Market never had to worry about leaving the store because the stockboy could take care of things.

Country-Market had been passed down in the same family for thirty years. The store had enjoyed unusual success because the owner knew how to make a profit while keeping his customers satisfied.

Because business had been good this year, the owner wanted to give one of his workers a raise. He knew the raise should go to the most deserving employee. This meant the employee should be hardworking and friendly with the customers. He thought about this and then decided upon the employee who he would give a raise to.

The owner gave a raise to the cashier. The cashier was happy about the bonus.

After telling the cashier the good news, the owner decided to get back to work. He had to order more supplies for the store.

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
Introduction
The research director of a scientific company was looking over some progress reports of his workers. As he continued looking, he jotted down some notes.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
He noted that the chemist was the company's most brilliant scientist. The chemist consistently worked long hours and had the best progress report by far. The research director thought it was a shame that the company's biologist failed to follow a faithful schedule. The biologist didn't get along with his colleagues and always received the worst progress reports.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
He noted that the biologist was the company's most brilliant scientist. The biologist consistently worked long hours and had the best progress report by far. The research director thought it was a shame that the company's chemist failed to follow a faithful schedule. The chemist didn't get along with her colleagues and always received the worst progress reports.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
He noted that it was a shame that the company's biologist failed to follow a faithful schedule. The biologist didn't get along with his colleagues and always received the worst progress reports. The research director did observe that the chemist was the company's most brilliant scientist. The chemist consistently worked long hours and had the best progress report by far.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
He noted that it was a shame that the company's chemist failed to follow a faithful schedule. The chemist didn't get along with her colleagues and always received the worst progress reports. The research director did observe that the biologist was the company's most brilliant scientist. The biologist consistently worked long hours and had the best progress report by far.

Character Shift
As the research director examined the reports, he received a phonecall from the company's president regarding a meeting. After hanging up, the director wanted to work on developing ways to increase satisfaction from his scientists.

Inference Context
Because he believed that the company's scientists should be recognized for their achievements, the research director decided to present an award to one of them. The research director knew that the recipient of such an award must be very intelligent and hardworking. After thinking about the characteristics of the scientists, the research director knew which scientist should receive the award.

Critical Sentences
He knew the chemist deserved the award.
The chemist happily accepted the award.

Conclusion
Then the research director flipped through his appointment book. He noticed that he had penned in a lunch date with a colleague and got up from his seat and left his office.
Introduction
The eleventh precinct was one of the busiest police stations in Detroit. Although it was a high crime area, the chief of police did his very best to keep the Detroit citizens safe.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
The chief of police was fortunate to have an experienced detective at the precinct. The chief thought the detective was a quick thinker and tough. He could easily intimidate many of the hoodlums on the street. However, the chief was concerned about the precinct's newest police officer. He had just graduated from the police academy and lacked vital experience. Such inexperience made the chief nervous because the officer was more likely to get hurt on the job.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
The chief of police was fortunate to have an experienced police officer at the precinct. The chief thought the officer was a quick thinker and tough. He could easily intimidate many of the hoodlums on the street. However, the chief was concerned about the precinct's newest detective. He had just been transferred to the precinct and lacked vital experience. Such inexperience made the chief nervous because the detective was more likely to get hurt on the job.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
However, the chief was concerned about the precinct's newest police officer. He had just graduated from the police academy and lacked vital experience. Such inexperience made the chief nervous because the officer was more likely to get hurt on the job. The chief of police was fortunate to have an experienced detective at the precinct. The chief thought the detective was a quick thinker and tough. He could easily intimidate many of the hoodlums on the street.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
However, the chief was concerned about the precinct's newest detective. He had just been transferred to the precinct and lacked vital experience. Such inexperience made the chief nervous because the detective was more likely to get hurt on the job. The chief of police was fortunate to have an experienced police officer at the precinct. The chief thought the officer was a quick thinker and tough. He could easily intimidate many of the hoodlums on the street.

Character Shift
One of the most pressing crime issues was related to the drug lords. Fortunately, the chief recently found a witness who was willing to testify against some of the drug lords in court.

Inference Context
In order to keep the witness safe, the chief planned to assign one of his men as a bodyguard. Because the witness' testimony was critical, the chief had to choose a man who was highly qualified for it. This meant that the man had to be strong and alert. The chief knew who would make the best qualified bodyguard.

Critical Sentences
He assigned the detective to the case.
The chief felt confident in his choice.

Conclusion
The chief was sure that he could send the drug lords to prison where they belonged. It was just a matter of time.
Introduction
Summer was almost over and it was time for Camp Navaho's annual competition. The camp
director was walking around the camp to ensure that everyone was preparing for the upcoming
meet.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
During his walk, he saw the camp's counselor jog by. She was quite active and jogged several
miles a day. The director thought that the counselor was in great shape. Then the director saw the
camp's stocky cook painting some signs for the sports competition. Everyone at camp
affectionately referred to him as "Bear." The cook didn't care for activities that required exertion but
volunteered to do less active things.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
During his walk, he saw the camp's cook jog by. She was quite athletic and jogged several miles a
day. The director thought that the cook was in great shape. Then the director saw the camp's
stocky counselor painting some signs for the sports competition. Everyone at camp affectionately
referred to him as "Bear." The counselor didn't care for activities that required exertion but
volunteered to do less active things.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
During his walk, he saw the camp's stocky cook painting some signs for the sports competition.
Everyone at camp affectionately referred to him as "Bear." The cook didn't care for activities that
required exertion but volunteered to do less active things. Then the director saw the camp's
counselor jog by. She was quite athletic and jogged several miles a day. The director thought that the
counselor was in great shape.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
During his walk, he saw the camp's stocky counselor painting some signs for the sports
competition. Everyone at camp affectionately referred to him as "Bear." The counselor didn't care
for activities that required exertion but volunteered to do less active things. Then the director saw
the camp's cook jog by. She was quite athletic and jogged several miles a day. The director thought that the cook was in great shape.

Character Shift
After he finished his walk around the grounds, the camp director returned to his cabin. Because the
weather forecast mentioned that there would be heavy showers that evening, the camp director
decided to have the camp watch a movie after dinner.

Inference Context
Before leaving his cabin for dinner, the camp director needed to pick a runner for the five mile race
for the sports competition. In order for Camp Navaho to win the race, the director knew he had to
choose the person who had great endurance and was athletic. The choice was an easy one for the
camp director to make.

Critical Sentences
He wanted the counselor to run the race.
He thought the counselor would be fast.

Conclusion
After making his decision, the camp director checked his watch. He wanted to make sure that he
wouldn't be late for dinner.
Introduction
The Rileys were spending the weekend in a luxurious hotel in New York City. They were excited about the trip because they had not gone away together for over a year.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
After checking into their room, the maid knocked on the door and politely asked the Rileys if they needed anything. While talking to the Rileys, the maid informed them of the best restaurants in the city and mentioned that she would be available if the Rileys needed help. After resting for awhile, the Rileys unpacked their clothes. Mrs. Riley saw the housekeeping supervisor in the hall and asked her for some extra towels. The supervisor abruptly handed the towels to Mrs. Riley and then walked away without saying a word.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
After checking into their room, the housekeeping supervisor knocked on the door and politely asked the Rileys if they needed anything. While talking to the Rileys, the supervisor informed them of the best restaurants in the city and mentioned that she would be available if the Rileys needed help. After resting for awhile, the Rileys unpacked their clothes. Mrs. Riley saw the maid in the hall and asked her for some extra towels. The maid abruptly handed the towels to Mrs. Riley and then walked away without saying a word.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
After checking into their room, Mrs. Riley saw the housekeeping supervisor in the hall and asked her for some extra towels. The supervisor abruptly handed the towels to Mrs. Riley and then walked away without saying a word. After resting for awhile, the Rileys unpacked their clothes. Then the maid knocked on the door and politely asked the Rileys if they needed anything. The maid informed the Rileys of the best restaurants in the city and mentioned that she would be available if the Rileys needed help.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
After checking into their room, Mrs. Riley saw the maid in the hall and asked her for some extra towels. The maid abruptly handed the towels to Mrs. Riley and then walked away without saying a word. After resting for awhile, the Rileys unpacked their clothes. Then the housekeeping supervisor knocked on the door and politely asked the Rileys if they needed any help. The supervisor informed the Rileys of the best restaurants in the city and mentioned that she would be available if the Rileys needed help.

Character Shift
During their short stay in New York, the Rileys went to the Museum of Natural History. They also enjoyed viewing the Empire State Building and South Street Seaport.

Inference Context
Before the Rileys checked out of the hotel, they planned to leave a generous tip for one of the hotel employees. They thought they would leave a tip to the employee who was the most courteous and helpful. Mrs. Riley thought about this and then decided which hotel employee she would leave a tip for.

Critical Sentences
She decided to give the tip to the maid.
The maid had been a great help to them.

Conclusion
They decided to give the maid a fifty dollar tip for her services. Because they loved New York City, the Rileys planned to visit it again the following year.
Introduction
Gold had been discovered in the mountains near the rural town of Dead Gulch, Montana. The government sent a major to Dead Gulch to find out how much gold there was. Dead Gulch was a rural town with few residents.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
When the major arrived at the small town store, he met a rather bright rancher who had been born and raised in Dead Gulch. The rancher said that he had considerable knowledge of the territory. After a brief conversation, the major tipped his hat and then searched the store to pick up a few supplies. While there, he talked to a dim-witted store clerk about living in Dead Gulch. The clerk replied that he had just recently moved to Dead Gulch and didn't know much about the area.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
When the major arrived at the small town store, he met a rather bright store clerk who had been born and raised in Dead Gulch. The clerk said that he had considerable knowledge of the territory. After a brief conversation, the major tipped his hat and then searched the store to pick up a few supplies. While there, he talked to a dim-witted rancher in the store about living in Dead Gulch. The rancher replied that he had just recently moved to Dead Gulch and didn't know much about the area.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
When the major arrived at the small town store, he talked to a dim-witted store clerk about living in Dead Gulch. The clerk replied that he had just recently moved to Dead Gulch and didn't know much about the area. After a brief conversation, the major tipped his hat and then searched the store to pick up a few supplies. While there, he met a rather bright rancher who had been born and raised in Dead Gulch. The rancher said that he had considerable knowledge of the territory.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
When the major arrived at the small town store, he talked to a dim-witted rancher about living in Dead Gulch. The rancher replied that he had just recently moved to Dead Gulch and didn't know much about the area. After a brief conversation, the major tipped his hat and then searched the store to pick up a few supplies. While there, he met a rather bright store clerk who had been born and raised in Dead Gulch. The clerk said that he had considerable knowledge of the territory.

Character Shift
When the major finished talking, he walked around the store for some canned goods. After paying, he packed them in his wagon.

Inference Context
Because the major was not familiar with the mountains, he was a bit hesitant about going through them alone. Before leaving the store, the major decided to ask one of the people he met to be a guide and take him through the mountains. He had to find someone who was intelligent and familiar with the area. After considering his options, the major made a decision who he would ask for help.

Critical Sentences
The major wanted the rancher as a guide.
The rancher agreed and they left town.

Conclusion
As they made their way up into the mountains, the major hoped he would find plenty of gold.
Introduction
Mark loved to go out on Friday nights and tonight was no exception. After having a beer at the pub, Mark and his friends took a taxi to a dance club. When they arrived, Mark scanned the dance floor for some colleagues he knew.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
He saw the company’s pretty secretary who often came to the club and loved to dance. Mark always enjoyed spending time with the secretary because she was interesting and friendly. As Mark was scanning the crowd, he saw the company’s bookkeeper dancing. Mark thought the bookkeeper’s dance movements were uncoordinated and that she appeared very clumsy.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
He saw the company’s pretty bookkeeper who often came to the club and loved to dance. Mark always enjoyed spending time with the bookkeeper because she was interesting and friendly. As Mark was scanning the crowd, he saw the company’s secretary dancing. Mark thought the secretary’s dance movements were uncoordinated and that she appeared very clumsy.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
He saw the company’s bookkeeper dancing. Mark thought the bookkeeper’s dance movements were uncoordinated and that she appeared very clumsy. As Mark was scanning the crowd, he saw the company’s pretty secretary who often came to the club and loved to dance. Mark always enjoyed spending time with the secretary because she was interesting and friendly.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
He saw the company’s secretary dancing. Mark thought the secretary’s dance movements were uncoordinated and that she appeared very clumsy. As Mark was scanning the crowd, he saw the company’s pretty bookkeeper who often came to the club and loved to dance. Mark always enjoyed spending time with the bookkeeper because she was interesting and friendly.

Character Shift
As Mark stood gazing at the crowd, his friends asked if he wanted a drink. Mark ordered a beer and sat on a stool.

Inference Context
He turned around on his stool and decided to ask one of his coworkers for a dance. He wanted to find a dance partner who was attractive and fun to be with. Also, it was important that his partner be a good dancer. After scanning the crowd again, Mark walked over to the coworker he wanted to ask to dance.

Critical Sentences
Mark wanted to dance with the secretary.
The secretary said it was a great idea.

Conclusion
They put down their drinks and walked out onto the dance floor. Although the dance floor was crowded, Mark had a great time.
Introduction
The Cliffs Edge was a hotel situated in the middle of a busy city. The state's prosecutor was staying at the hotel for a few days while she tried to rally support for her campaign for governor.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
During her stay, the prosecutor observed a violent argument between the manager and the hotel owner. The owner fired the manager for stealing some of the profits. He swore to get back at the owner and left the hotel in a mad rage. Then the owner called the bellhop. Because the hotel was crowded that evening, the owner asked him to stay an hour overtime. The dedicated bellhop said he would be pleased to stay.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
During her stay, the prosecutor observed a violent argument between the bellhop and the hotel owner. The owner fired the bellhop for stealing some of the profits. He swore to get back at the owner and left the hotel in a mad rage. Then the owner called the manager. Because the hotel was crowded that evening, the owner asked him to stay an hour overtime. The dedicated manager said he would be pleased to stay.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
During her stay, the prosecutor observed that the hotel owner called the bellhop. Because the hotel was crowded that evening, the owner asked him to stay an hour overtime. The dedicated bellhop said he would be pleased to stay. Then the prosecutor observed a violent argument between the manager and the hotel owner. The owner fired the manager for stealing some of the profits. He swore to get back at the owner and left the hotel in a mad rage.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
During her stay, the prosecutor observed that the hotel owner called the manager. Because the hotel was crowded that evening, the owner asked him to stay an hour overtime. The dedicated manager said he would be pleased to stay. Then the prosecutor observed a violent argument between the bellhop and the hotel owner. The owner fired the bellhop for stealing some of the profits. He swore to get back at the owner and left the hotel in a mad rage.

Character Shift
After things returned to normal the prosecutor decided to have breakfast in the hotel. After she finished, the prosecutor noticed that a crowd had gathered around the owner's office and that the owner had been strangled.

Inference Context
The prosecutor was horrified and wanted to solve the murder as quickly as possible. She knew from past experiences that murders tended to result from highly charged emotional situations. She had a hunch that the motive was revenge and that the murderer was crazed with anger. After reviewing the evidence, she called a press conference to name the logical murder suspect.

Critical Sentences
She accused the manager of the murder.
She put out a warrant for his arrest.

Conclusion
After the press conference, the prosecutor returned to her room. She had a lot of work to do if she was going to solve the case.
The passages from Experiments 3, 4, and 5 are presented below. The critical sentences and conclusion sections were eliminated in Experiments 4 and 5.
Introduction
Everybody agreed that the Wildcats had more raw talent than any other team in the league. Unfortunately, the Wildcats were in the midst of a long losing streak. In addition, there was animosity building up between the team players.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
At least the catcher's attitude and skill seemed unaffected by the losing streak. The catcher had outstanding leadership abilities and was a favorite with the rest of the players. Still, there was animosity building up between the team players. The shortstop had begun criticizing other players each time the team lost a game. Most of the other players did not like the shortstop because he didn't have any team spirit.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
At least the shortstop's attitude and skill seemed unaffected by the losing streak. The shortstop had outstanding leadership abilities and was a favorite with the rest of the players. Still, there was animosity building up between the team players. The catcher had begun criticizing other players each time the team lost a game. Most of the other players did not like the catcher because he didn't have any team spirit.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
In addition, there was animosity building up between the team players. The shortstop had begun criticizing other players each time the team lost a game. Most of the other players did not like the shortstop because he didn't have any team spirit. At least the catcher's attitude and skill seemed unaffected by the losing streak. The catcher had outstanding leadership abilities and was a favorite with the rest of the players.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
In addition, there was animosity building up between the team players. The catcher had begun criticizing other players each time the team lost a game. Most of the other players did not like the catcher because he didn't have any team spirit. At least the shortstop's attitude and skill seemed unaffected by the losing streak. The shortstop had outstanding leadership abilities and was a favorite with the rest of the players.

Background
Morale was especially low following the Wildcats' sixth straight loss. After the game, the manager returned to his office to study a recent game film. The manager took down extensive notes as he watched the film. Then he carefully planned his team's strategy for the next game. Before leaving his office, the manager filled out a team roster. Early the following morning, the manager arrived at the stadium.

Inference Context
To build morale and divert his team from their current losing streak, the manager wanted to appoint a team captain. The manager knew he had to select a player who was strong and could inspire the other players. The captain had to be the best overall team player. After considering the options, the manager made his choice.

Critical Sentences
He named the catcher the team captain.
The catcher gladly accepted the honor.

Conclusion
In order to psych up his players for the game, the manager delivered a compelling pep talk. After his speech, the Wildcats charged out onto the field.
Introduction
Eddie had been in prison for five years and decided it was time to break out. One day during the daily recreational period, Eddie saw an opportunity to get away. He ran down a corridor leading to a nearby exit and peered around the corner to see if anyone was there.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
He saw the slight and frail desk guard doing some paperwork in his office. The guard was getting old and was supposed to retire the following year. Then Eddie looked down the other end of the hallway. Eddie saw the warden sitting and reading a newspaper. The warden was fierce and Eddie knew he would be overmatched by the big and burly man.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
He saw the slight and frail warden doing some paperwork in his office. The warden was getting old and was supposed to retire the following year. Then Eddie looked down the other end of the hallway. Eddie saw the guard sitting and reading a newspaper. The guard was fierce and Eddie knew he would be overmatched by the big and burly man.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
Eddie saw the warden sitting and reading a newspaper. The warden was fierce and Eddie knew he would be overmatched by the big and burly man. Then Eddie looked down the other end of the hallway. He saw the slight and frail desk guard doing some paperwork in his office. The guard was getting old and was supposed to retire the following year.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
Eddie saw the desk guard sitting and reading a newspaper. The guard was fierce and Eddie knew he would be overmatched by the big and burly man. Then Eddie looked down the other end of the hallway. He saw the slight and frail warden doing some paperwork in his office. The warden was getting old and was supposed to retire the following year.

Background
Eddie went over his escape plan in his head. He was glad that he had been able to steal the floorplans of the prison. By studying them extensively, he had figured out the best escape route. Now Eddie was ready to make his escape. He quickly scanned the area and quietly moved down the hall.

Inference Context
In order to make his escape proceed smoothly, Eddie looked for a hostage. Because he didn't have any weapons, Eddie knew he should choose a hostage who was weaker and smaller than himself. He looked down each end of the hallway again and decided who he would take for a hostage.

Critical Sentences
Eddie grabbed the guard for a hostage.
He quickly warned the guard to be quiet.

Conclusion
Then Eddie moved down the stairs with his hostage. As they reached the last step, Eddie saw the door that would lead to his freedom.
Mrs. Hall was throwing a big birthday party for her little five-year old son. She decided to go to a party store to get some ideas. Mrs. Hall liked this party store because they had so many things to offer such as live entertainment. Mrs. Hall entered the store, she was greeted by a jolly clown wearing adorable make-up. He was amusing some children by telling them jokes. The children giggled during the clown's silly act. Then Mrs. Hall walked down one of the store aisles. She saw a magician wearing scary make-up. She shivered when he cackled at her. Mrs. Hall thought that little children would be very frightened of the magician.

As Mrs. Hall entered the store, she was greeted by a jolly magician wearing adorable make-up. He was amusing some children by telling them jokes. The children giggled during the magician's silly act. Then Mrs. Hall walked down one of the store aisles. She saw a clown wearing scary make-up. She shivered when he cackled at her. Mrs. Hall thought that little children would be very frightened of the clown.

As Mrs. Hall entered the store, she was greeted by a clown who was wearing scary make-up. She shivered when he cackled at her. Mrs. Hall thought that little children would be very frightened of the clown. Then Mrs. Hall walked down one of the store aisles where she saw a jolly magician wearing adorable make-up. He was amusing some children by telling them jokes. The children giggled during the clown's silly act.

Mrs. Hall went down another store aisle. She picked up several packages of various shaped and colored balloons. Then Mrs. Hall looked around the rest of the store for more party ideas. She picked up some cute party hats and noisemakers. Then she chose some fancy decorations to hang up on the walls. After she finished looking around, Mrs. Hall brought the things she wanted to the cashier.

Mrs. Hall told the cashier she wanted to hire one of the store's entertainers for a birthday party. Mrs. Hall wanted an entertainer her young son would like. She knew that the entertainer should be funny and love interacting with small kids. Based on her observation at the party store, Mrs. Hall made a decision on who she should hire.

Mrs. Hall hired the clown for the party. She knew the clown would be a success.

Then Mrs. Hall walked out of the store. She got in her car and drove to the mall to buy her son another birthday present.
Introduction
It was the holiday season and Dave was in the mall Christmas shopping. As he was going by the different stores, he passed a pet shop. He thought it might be fun to look at the animals. Dave entered the shop and saw a number of dog cages.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
One cage held a friendly spaniel that happily wagged its tail as Dave peered into the cage. The shop owner told Dave that the spaniel was gentle and good-natured. When Dave looked into another cage, he saw a vicious poodle that snarled and snapped aggressively at him. The shop owner said that the poodle had once been mistreated and warned Dave not to put his hand near the cage because it would bite him.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
One cage held a friendly poodle that happily wagged its tail as Dave peered into the cage. The shop owner told Dave that the poodle was gentle and good-natured. When Dave looked into another cage, he saw a vicious spaniel that snarled and snapped aggressively at him. The shop owner said that the spaniel had once been mistreated and warned Dave not to put his hand near the cage because it would bite him.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
When Dave looked into one cage, he saw a vicious poodle that snarled and snapped aggressively at him. The shop owner said that the poodle had once been mistreated and warned Dave not to put his hand near the cage because it would bite him. Then Dave looked in another cage which held a friendly spaniel that happily wagged its tail as Dave peered into the cage. The shop owner told Dave that the spaniel was gentle and good-natured.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
When Dave looked into one cage, he saw a vicious spaniel that snarled and snapped aggressively at him. The shop owner said that the spaniel had once been mistreated and warned Dave not to put his hand near the cage because it would bite him. Then Dave looked in another cage which held a friendly poodle that happily wagged its tail as Dave peered into the cage. The shop owner told Dave that the poodle was gentle and good-natured.

Background
Then Dave strolled over to the birds and saw a parrot perched on a small tree branch. He laughed when the bird said hello. Dave asked the shop owner if he could feed the parrot. The shop owner nodded and gave Dave a cracker. As soon as the parrot saw what Dave held in his hand, it walked across the perch and reached for the cracker with its beak.

Inference Context
When Dave finished feeding the parrot, he decided to buy a dog for his son. Because his son was young, Dave thought he should pick out a dog which was docile and easy going. It was also important that he chose a playful dog for his son. After scanning the dog cages again, Dave decided what dog to buy.

Critical Sentences
Dave decided to buy his son the spaniel.
He thought it would be a nice surprise.

Conclusion
Dave cheerfully walked out of the shop. He hoped that all of his Christmas shopping would be this easy.
Introduction
The old king had ruled over the land for the past twenty-five years. Throughout his reign, he had enjoyed being popular with his subjects.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
However, the king had not always been so popular. The people had become disenchanted with the king when he appointed the prince to his court. The prince was clever but not concerned with the well-being of the kingdom. People thought that he was deceitful and out to steal the throne from the king. Nevertheless, the king's popularity had surged with the arrival of the duke. The people were proud to have such a kind and good fellow in the kingdom. The duke often visited the people to give them money and food.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
However, the king had not always been so popular. The people had become disenchanted with the king when he appointed the duke to his court. The duke was clever but not concerned with the well-being of the kingdom. People thought that he was deceitful and out to steal the throne from the king. Nevertheless, the king's popularity had surged with the arrival of the prince. The people were proud to have such a kind and good fellow in the kingdom. The prince often visited the people to give them money and food.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
The king's popularity had surged with the arrival of the duke. The people were proud to have such a kind and good fellow in the kingdom. The duke often visited the people to give them money and food. However, the king had not always so popular. The people had become disenchanted with the king when he appointed the prince to his court. The prince was clever but not concerned with the well-being of the kingdom. People thought that he was deceitful and out to steal the throne from the king.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
The king's popularity had surged with the arrival of the prince. The people were proud to have such a kind and good fellow in the kingdom. The prince often visited the people to give them money and food. However, the king had not always so popular. The people had become disenchanted with the king when he appointed the duke to his court. The duke was clever but not concerned with the well-being of the kingdom. People thought that he was deceitful and out to steal the throne from the king.

Background
This evening the king was having a huge banquet. The old king was excited about it and hoped that his invited guests would enjoy themselves. However, before the feast, the king called an impromptu meeting with his advisors. He wanted an update on the kingdom's current events. At the meeting, the king was informed that top secret information was being leaked to an enemy country.

Inference Context
In order to maintain the safety of the kingdom, the king knew he had to catch the spy. In order for the spy to have gotten secret information, the king knew that the spy must be intelligent and sneaky. Because the king reasoned that the spy must be someone he knew, he quickly figured out who the spy was.

Critical Sentences
He accused the prince of being the spy.
The prince was locked up in the tower.

Conclusion
Now that the incident had been resolved, the king was determined to enjoy himself at the feast. He was relieved that his kingdom was safe from harm.
Introduction
The end of spring semester was rapidly approaching. This was the dean's favorite time of the year because she enjoyed watching the university's seniors graduate. Currently, the dean was in her office looking at a list of famous alumni.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
One alumni was a famous politician who was well known for his eloquent communication skills. It was clear to the dean that the politician was wise and articulate. Then the dean continued looking over her list. She came across the name of a well-known writer who had previously been involved in a scandalous affair. The dean's impression was that the writer did not handle the situation well with the media because he did not know how to communicate to the public.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
One alumni was a famous writer who was well known for his eloquent communication skills. It was clear to the dean that the writer was wise and articulate. Then the dean continued looking over her list. She came across the name of a well-known politician who had previously been involved in a scandalous affair. The dean's impression was that the politician did not handle the situation well with the media because he did not know how to communicate to the public.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
She came across the name of a well-known politician who had previously been involved in a scandalous affair. The dean's impression was that the politician did not handle the situation well with the media because he did not know how to communicate to the public. Then the dean continued looking over her list. Another alumni was a famous writer who was well known for his eloquent communication skills. It was clear to the dean that the writer was wise and articulate.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
She came across the name of a well-known politician who had previously been involved in a scandalous affair. The dean's impression was that the politician did not handle the situation well with the media because he did not know how to communicate to the public. Then the dean continued looking over her list. Another alumni was a famous writer who was well known for his eloquent communication skills. It was clear to the dean that the writer was wise and articulate.

Background
After perusing the alumni list, the dean checked her watch. She had to attend a meeting and she did not want to be late. She got up from her desk and walked down the hall to the conference room. This meeting was important because they were deciding where the university could make cuts in the budget. The meeting was concluded in two hours and the dean returned to her office.

Inference Context
Because graduation was approaching, the dean needed to find a commencement speaker. She looked for some ideas from the alumni list. Because the commencement speech could have a big impact on the graduating class, the dean planned to ask an alumnus who was intelligent and well spoken. She looked over the list of alumni again and then made a choice.

Critical Sentences
The dean decided to ask the politician.
She hoped that he would give the speech.

Conclusion
The dean made the necessary phone calls. She was informed that she would receive a decision regarding the commencement speaker in a few days.
Introduction
Sheila was the lead singer of a local rock band. She was excited because the band had an audition for a record company.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
The guitarist of the band had practiced extensively for the audition. Sheila had never seen him so self assured. She thought the guitarist was gifted and had the most artistic skill in the band. Unfortunately, Sheila didn't think the band's new drummer would pan out. The drummer often made mistakes and experienced stage fright.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
The drummer of the band had practiced extensively for the audition. Sheila had never seen him so self assured. She thought the drummer was gifted and had the most artistic skill in the band. Unfortunately, Sheila didn't think the band's new guitarist would pan out. The guitarist often made mistakes and experienced stage fright. The band had to cover up for him during these moments.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
Unfortunately, Sheila didn't think the band's new guitarist would pan out. The guitarist often made mistakes and experienced stage fright. The band had to cover up for him during these moments. She was glad that the drummer had practiced extensively for the audition. Sheila had never seen him so self assured. She thought the drummer was gifted and had the most artistic skill in the band.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
Unfortunately, Sheila didn't think the band's new drummer would pan out. The drummer often made mistakes and experienced stage fright. The band had to cover up for him during these moments. She was glad that the guitarist had practiced extensively for the audition. Sheila had never seen him so self assured. She thought the guitarist was gifted and had the most artistic skill in the band.

Background
Sheila got the band members together to practice a song she had finished writing. She had been working on it for two weeks and thought it was one of her finest pieces. She hoped the band would be ready to perform the number for the audition. After the members had arrived at Sheila's home, they practiced the song. They sounded great and Sheila knew they were ready for the audition.

Inference Context
Because Sheila wanted to impress the record producer during the audition, she planned to have a band member do a solo during the song. In order for the solo to go well, she had to choose the band's most talented and confident musician to do it. Sheila knew there was only one member of the band who fulfilled these requirements.

Critical Sentences
She asked the guitarist to do the solo.
Sheila thought he would play perfectly.

Conclusion
After several hours of practice, the band took a well deserved break. They were excited about the audition and talked about it for the remainder of the afternoon.
Introduction
It was football preseason and the coach of the Eagles was preparing his team for a solid season.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
Unfortunately, one of the team’s quarterbacks was playing terribly during practice. He lacked team spirit and didn’t work hard to develop the expertise necessary for playing football. In fact, the quarterback hadn’t seen any playing time in two years. However, the Eagles were excited about their all-state receiver who had spent three years with the team. The receiver was considered to have the most talent in the league. The other players were proud to have him on the team.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
Unfortunately, one of the team’s receivers was playing terribly during practice. He lacked team spirit and didn’t work hard to develop the expertise necessary for playing football. In fact, the receiver hadn’t seen any playing time in two years. However, the Eagles were excited about their all-state quarterback who had spent three years with the team. The quarterback was considered to have the most talent in the league. The other players were proud to have him on the team.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
The Eagles were excited about their all-state receiver who had spent three years with the team. The receiver was considered to have the most talent in the league. The other players were proud to have him on the team. Unfortunately, one of the team’s quarterbacks was playing terribly during practice. He lacked team spirit and didn’t work hard to develop the expertise necessary for playing football. In fact, the quarterback hadn’t seen any playing time in two years.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
The Eagles were excited about their all-state quarterback who had spent three years with the team. The quarterback was considered to have the most talent in the league. The other players were proud to have him on the team. Unfortunately, one of the team’s receivers was playing terribly during practice. He lacked team spirit and didn’t work hard to develop the expertise necessary for playing football. In fact, the receiver hadn’t seen any playing time in two years.

Background
Because there were few practice sessions left before the start of the season, the coach made the most of them. The Eagles were playing their first season in a new stadium and the coach wanted the team to be familiar with the new turf. After one practice, the coach held a meeting with the players to discuss game strategies. The meeting went well and the coach retired to his office.

Inference Context
At the moment, the coach had to cut one more player from the Eagles because there were too many players on the team. This meant he had to cut the team’s least skilled player. It was critical that he keep his best player and cut the player who was lazy and unsportsmanlike. Without any hesitation, the coach made his choice.

Critical Sentences
He cut the quarterback from the Eagles.
He thought this was the best decision.

Conclusion
The coach planned to use the second string quarterback because he was playing well. The coach hoped to work with him in order to get him in shape for the Eagle’s first season game.
Introduction
The crew on the luxury liner was preparing for its weekly cruise. After completing a final inspection, the captain gave the orders for the ship to set course for Aruba. Several hours after departing, several passengers stopped by the ship's hospitality office to provide some written comments about the crew.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
The captain was dismayed to see that the passengers complained about the purser's shifty behavior. Many passengers said they did not trust the purser because he looked dishonest and had been observed lurking by the cabins. However, the captain was not at all surprised to see the glowing remarks written about the ship's cruise director. Not only had the director been with the same cruise line for over six years, but she was always trusted by the passengers.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
The captain was dismayed to see that the passengers complained about the cruise director's shifty behavior. Many passengers said they did not trust the director because she looked dishonest and had been observed lurking by the cabins. However, the captain was not at all surprised to see the glowing remarks written about the ship's purser. Not only had the purser been with the same cruise line for over six years, but he was always trusted by the passengers.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
The captain was not at all surprised to see the glowing remarks written about the ship's cruise director. Not only had the director been with the same cruise line for over six years, but she was always trusted by the passengers. However, the captain was dismayed to hear that the passengers complained about the purser's shifty behavior. Many passengers said they did not trust the purser because he looked dishonest and had been observed lurking by the cabins.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
The captain was not at all surprised to see the glowing remarks written about the ship's purser. Not only had the purser been with the same cruise line for over six years, but he was always trusted by the passengers. However, the captain was dismayed to hear that the passengers complained about the cruise director's shifty behavior. Many passengers said they did not trust the director because she looked dishonest and had been observed lurking by the cabins.

Background
The captain finished reading the comments and headed for the first deck. He was looking forward to going to Aruba. The ship would arrive there in three days and stay in port for another two. As the captain was thinking about the cruise, he was approached by two of the passengers. The passengers were very upset and said that their jewelry had been stolen from their rooms.

Inference Context
In order to maintain order on the ship, the captain wanted to nab the thief quickly. He had a hunch that the thief was a ship employee. In addition, the captain reasoned that the thief must be deceptive and sly in order to steal valuables. After conducting a thorough investigation, the captain determined the identity of the thief.

Critical Sentences
He accused the purser of the burglaries.
The purser was locked away in a cabin.

Conclusion
The captain planned to drop the culprit off at the closest port. The remainder of the trip was uneventful.
Claremont Hospital was situated in one of the poorest sections of the city and was designed to help those who couldn't afford health care. Because of reduced government funding, the hospital could only employ a small number of staff.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
Because the hospital couldn't afford to pay high salaries, it recently had to hire an inexperienced doctor. He had made several thoughtless mistakes which had affected the recovery of several patients. The hospital couldn't lose the doctor because the hospital was already understaffed. Fortunately, some of the staff was dedicated to practicing good medicine. The hospital's head nurse was very skilled and happily spent the past ten years at Claremont. She had acquired extensive experience during those years. As a result, the hospital considered the nurse very knowledgeable and responsible.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
Because the hospital couldn't afford to pay high salaries, it recently had to hire an inexperienced nurse. She had made several thoughtless mistakes which had affected the recovery of several patients. The hospital couldn't lose the nurse because the hospital was already understaffed. Fortunately, some of the staff was dedicated to practicing good medicine. The hospital's doctor was very skilled and happily spent the past ten years at Claremont. He had acquired extensive experience during those years. As a result, the hospital considered the doctor very knowledgeable and responsible.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
Fortunately, some of the staff was dedicated to practicing good medicine. The hospital's head nurse was very skilled and happily spent the past ten years at Claremont. She had acquired extensive experience during those years. As a result, the hospital considered the nurse very knowledgeable and responsible. Still, because the hospital couldn't afford to pay high salaries, it recently had to hire an inexperienced doctor. He had made several thoughtless mistakes which had affected the recovery of several patients. The hospital couldn't lose the doctor because the hospital was already understaffed.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
Fortunately, some of the staff was dedicated to practicing good medicine. The hospital's doctor was very skilled and happily spent the past ten years at Claremont. He had acquired extensive experience during those years. As a result, the hospital considered the doctor very knowledgeable and responsible. Still, because the hospital couldn't afford to pay high salaries, it recently had to hire an inexperienced nurse. She had made several thoughtless mistakes which had affected the recovery of several patients. The hospital couldn't lose the nurse because the hospital was already understaffed.

Background
Claremont Hospital was run by a well respected health director. The health director had purposely designed the hospital to help low income people in need of health care. The health director was proud that the hospital was quite respected in the medical field. However, Claremont was currently under investigation because one of its patients had recently died from human error.

Inference Context
In order to maintain the medical services to the people, the health director was determined to find the hospital employee responsible for the error. From past experience, the director thought that the individual who was responsible for the death was likely to be careless and lacking medical knowledge. The director investigated the situation and quickly found out who was responsible.

Critical Sentences
The doctor was the cause of the death.
The doctor had to face a review board.

Conclusion
The health director informed the doctor that he had to take a leave of absence from the hospital. The health director hoped that he could find a replacement soon.
Introduction
Cafe La Rive was one of the most popular restaurants in the summer town of Mastic Beach. The owner of Cafe La Rive found that she was busiest during summer because it was tourist season.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
Recently, customers started complaining about the restaurant's waiter because he slacked off during the job. The waiter was often late coming to take the customer's orders, which left many of them disgruntled. Nevertheless, many of the customers were fond of the hostess. The hostess was respectful to the customers and performed her job exceedingly well.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
Recently, customers started complaining about the restaurant's hostess because she slacked off during the job. The hostess was often late coming to seat the customers, which left many of them disgruntled. Nevertheless, many of the customers were fond of the waiter. The waiter was respectful to the customers and performed his job exceedingly well.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
Many of the customers were fond of the restaurant's hostess. The hostess was respectful to the customers and performed her job exceedingly well. However, customers started complaining about the waiter because he slacked off during the job. The waiter was often late coming to take the customer's orders, which left many of them disgruntled.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
Many of the customers were fond of the restaurant's waiter. The waiter was respectful to the customers and performed his job exceedingly well. However, customers started complaining about the hostess because she slacked off during the job. The hostess was often late seating the customers, which left many of them disgruntled.

Background
Because it was summer, the owner's responsibilities increased. This afternoon, she decided to spend some time balancing her books. She had fallen behind already and hated it when her work piled up. The owner had gotten out the necessary materials and went to work. After a couple of hours, she was finished. She was a little dismayed that business had not been as good that summer.

Inference Context
In order to cut back on expenses, the owner planned to lay off one of her employees. For the good of the restaurant, she thought she should lay off the employee who the customers thought was lazy and did not care for. After thinking about the performances of her employees, the owner made a decision on who she would fire.

Critical Sentences
The owner decided to lay off the waiter.
She thought this was the best decision.

Conclusion
Because she was tired from work, the owner got in her car and drove home. She was looking forward to spending a relaxing evening with her husband.
It was Saturday morning and Tim was glad that he had the day off. He spent the morning making pancakes for himself.

After eating breakfast, Tim remembered that there was a great picnic that afternoon. Tim was excited about the picnic because there would be plenty of good food and friends. He thought it would be a fun way to spend the afternoon. Suddenly, Tim realized that his neighbors had invited him to a party that afternoon too. He thought that the party would be boring because he wouldn't know anyone well and was uncomfortable in new situations. Because Tim had a hard time talking to strangers, he thought he would not have a good time there.

After eating breakfast, Tim remembered that there was a great party that afternoon. Tim was excited about the party because there would be plenty of good food and friends. He thought it would be a fun way to spend the afternoon. Suddenly, Tim realized that his neighbors had invited him to a picnic that afternoon too. He thought that the picnic would be boring because he wouldn't know anyone well and was uncomfortable in new situations. Because Tim had a hard time talking to strangers, he thought he would not have a good time there.

After eating breakfast, Tim remembered that his neighbors had invited him to a party that afternoon. He thought that the party would be boring because he wouldn't know anyone well and was uncomfortable in new situations. Because Tim had a hard time talking to strangers, he thought he would not have a good time there. Then Tim realized that there was a great picnic that afternoon too. Tim was excited about the picnic because there would be plenty of good food and friends. He thought it would be a fun way to spend the afternoon.

Tim finished his pancakes and cleared the table. Then he washed and dried the dishes and put them away in the cupboard. Then he jumped in the shower. After showering, he wrapped a towel around his waist and shaved. Once he finished shaving, Tim put on a pair of comfortable jeans and a freshly laundered shirt.

Because he had the afternoon off, Tim wanted to find something to do. It was important for him to do something that he would enjoy because he rarely had time off. Tim liked to spend his free time with people he knew he would have fun with. After thinking for a minute, Tim decided how he would spend his afternoon.

Tim decided he would go to the picnic. He grabbed his keys and shut the door.

Tim started his car and drove off. He was looking forward to the fun he would be having that afternoon.
Introduction
Country-Market was a small grocery store in a little country town. Because of its size, the market had few employees. In addition, most of the local kids had to work on the family farms so the selection of potential employees was limited.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
The store's cashier was diligent and punctual. She never missed a day of work and was always cheerful with the customers. The owner of Country-Market never had to worry about leaving the store because the cashier could take care of things. Unfortunately, the stockboy was not very much help. He was lazy and often showed up late for work. Although the owner had reprimanded the stockboy for such problems, it didn't seem to do any good.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
The store's stockboy was diligent and punctual. He never missed a day of work and was always cheerful with the customers. The owner of Country-Market never had to worry about leaving the store because the stockboy could take care of things. Unfortunately, the cashier was not very much help. She was lazy and often showed up late for work. Although the owner had reprimanded the cashier for such problems, it didn't seem to do any good.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
Unfortunately, the store's stockboy was not very much help. He was lazy and often showed up late for work. Although the owner had reprimanded the stockboy for such problems, it didn't seem to do any good. However, the cashier was diligent and punctual. She never missed a day of work and was always cheerful with the customers. The owner of Country-Market never had to worry about leaving the store because the cashier could take care of things.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
Unfortunately, the store's cashier was not very much help. She was lazy and often showed up late for work. Although the owner had reprimanded the cashier for such problems, it didn't seem to do any good. However, the stockboy was diligent and punctual. He never missed a day of work and was always cheerful with the customers. The owner of Country-Market never had to worry about leaving the store because the stockboy could take care of things.

Background
Country-Market had been passed down in the same family for thirty years. The store had enjoyed unusual success because the owner knew how to make a profit while keeping his customers satisfied. He ordered only the finest of products and kept prices as low as he possibly could. This ensured that the customers would keep shopping at Country-Market.

Inference Context
Because business had been good this year, the owner wanted to give one of his workers a raise. He knew the raise should go to the most deserving employee. This meant the employee should be hardworking and friendly with the customers. He thought about this and then decided upon the employee who he would give a raise to.

Critical Sentences
The owner gave a raise to the cashier.
The cashier was happy about the bonus.

Conclusion
After telling the cashier the good news, the owner decided to get back to work. He had to order more supplies for the store.
Introduction
The research director of a scientific company was looking over some progress reports of his workers. As he continued looking, he jotted down some notes.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
He noted that the chemist was the company's most brilliant scientist. The chemist consistently worked long hours and had the best progress report by far. The research director thought it was a shame that the company's biologist failed to follow a faithful schedule. The biologist didn't get along with his colleagues and always received the worst progress reports.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
He noted that the biologist was the company's most brilliant scientist. The biologist consistently worked long hours and had the best progress report by far. The research director thought it was a shame that the company's chemist failed to follow a faithful schedule. The chemist didn't get along with her colleagues and always received the worst progress reports.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
He noted that it was a shame that the company's biologist failed to follow a faithful schedule. The biologist didn't get along with his colleagues and always received the worst progress reports. The research director did observe that the chemist was the company's most brilliant scientist. The chemist consistently worked long hours and had the best progress report by far.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
He noted that it was a shame that the company's chemist failed to follow a faithful schedule. The chemist didn't get along with her colleagues and always received the worst progress reports. The research director did observe that the biologist was the company's most brilliant scientist. The biologist consistently worked long hours and had the best progress report by far.

Background
As the research director examined the progress reports, he received a phonecall from the company's president. The president wanted to meet with the research director that week. The president said that they had important business to discuss. After finding a time when both of them could meet, the research director hung up the phone. This afternoon, he wanted to work on developing new ways to increase satisfaction from his scientists.

Inference Context
Because he believed that the company's scientists should be recognized for their achievements, the research director decided to present an award to one of them. The research director knew that the recipient of such an award must be very intelligent and hardworking. After thinking about the characteristics of the scientists, the research director knew which scientist should receive the award.

Critical Sentences
He knew the chemist deserved the award.
The chemist happily accepted the award.

Conclusion
Then the research director flipped through his appointment book. He noticed that he had penned in a lunch date with a colleague and got up from his seat and left his office.
The eleventh precinct was one of the busiest police stations in Detroit. Although it was a high crime area, the chief of police did his very best to keep the Detroit citizens safe.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
The chief of police was fortunate to have an experienced detective at the precinct. The chief thought the detective was a quick thinker and tough. He could easily intimidate many of the hoodlums on the street. However, the chief was concerned about the precinct's newest police officer. He had just graduated from the police academy and lacked vital experience. Such inexperience made the chief nervous because the officer was more likely to get hurt on the job.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
The chief of police was fortunate to have an experienced police officer at the precinct. The chief thought the officer was a quick thinker and tough. He could easily intimidate many of the hoodlums on the street. However, the chief was concerned about the precinct's newest detective. He had just been transferred to the precinct and lacked vital experience. Such inexperience made the chief nervous because the detective was more likely to get hurt on the job.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
However, the chief was concerned about the precinct's newest police officer. He had just graduated from the police academy and lacked vital experience. Such inexperience made the chief nervous because the officer was more likely to get hurt on the job. The chief of police was fortunate to have an experienced detective at the precinct. The chief thought the detective was a quick thinker and tough. He could easily intimidate many of the hoodlums on the street.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
However, the chief was concerned about the precinct's newest detective. He had just been transferred to the precinct and lacked vital experience. Such inexperience made the chief nervous because the detective was more likely to get hurt on the job. The chief of police was fortunate to have an experienced police officer at the precinct. The chief thought the officer was a quick thinker and tough. He could easily intimidate many of the hoodlums on the street.

Background
One of the most pressing crime issues was related to the drug lords. As long as the chief could remember, the drug lords had been terrorizing the city. The chief had been trying to nail them but was unable to provide enough evidence for a court case. However, the chief recently found a witness who was willing to testify against some of the drug lords in court.

Inference Context
In order to keep the witness safe, the chief planned to assign one of his men as a bodyguard. Because the witness' testimony was critical, the chief had to choose a man who was highly qualified for it. This meant that the man had to be strong and alert. The chief knew who would make the best qualified bodyguard.

Critical Sentences
He assigned the detective to the case.
The chief felt confident in his choice.

Conclusion
The chief was sure that he could send the drug lords to prison where they belonged. It was just a matter of time.
Introduction
Summer was almost over and it was time for Camp Navaho's annual competition. The camp
director was walking around the camp to ensure that everyone was preparing for the upcoming
meet.

**Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st**
During his walk, he saw the camp's counselor jog by. She was quite active and jogged several
miles a day. The director thought that the counselor was in great shape. Then the director saw the
camp's stocky cook painting some signs for the sports competition. Everyone at camp
affectionately referred to him as "Bear." The cook didn't care for activities that required exertion but
volunteered to do less active things.

**Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st**
During his walk, he saw the camp's cook jog by. She was quite athletic and jogged several miles a
day. The director thought that the cook was in great shape. Then the director saw the camp's
stocky counselor painting some signs for the sports competition. Everyone at camp affectionately
referred to him as "Bear." The counselor didn't care for activities that required exertion but
volunteered to do less active things.

**Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd**
During his walk, he saw the camp's stocky cook painting some signs for the sports competition.
Everyone at camp affectionately referred to him as "Bear." The cook didn't care for activities that
required exertion but volunteered to do less active things. Then the director saw the camp's
counselor jog by. She was quite athletic and jogged several miles a day. The director thought the
counselor was in great shape.

**Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd**
During his walk, he saw the camp's stocky counselor painting some signs for the sports
competition. Everyone at camp affectionately referred to him as "Bear." The counselor didn't care for activities that required exertion but volunteered to do less active things. Then the director saw the camp's
cook jog by. She was quite athletic and jogged several miles a day. The director thought the
counselor was in great shape.

Background
After he finished his walk around the grounds, the camp director returned to his cabin. He
remembered that he still had to make a schedule for the evening. Because the weather forecast
mentioned that there would be heavy showers that evening, the camp director decided to have the
camp watch a movie. He picked out a movie that many of the campers had requested to see.

**Inference Context**
Before leaving his cabin for dinner, the camp director needed to pick a runner for the five mile race
for the sports competition. In order for Camp Navaho to win the race, the director knew he had to
choose the person who had great endurance and was athletic. The choice was an easy one for the
camp director to make.

**Critical Sentences**
He wanted the counselor to run the race.
He thought the counselor would be fast.

**Conclusion**
After making his decision, the camp director checked his watch. He wanted to make sure that he
wouldn't be late for dinner.
The Rileys were spending the weekend in a luxurious hotel in New York City. They were excited about the trip because they had not gone away together for over a year.

After checking into their room, the maid knocked on the door and politely asked the Rileys if they needed anything. While talking to the Rileys, the maid informed them of the best restaurants in the city and mentioned that she would be available if the Rileys needed help. After resting for awhile, the Rileys unpacked their clothes. Mrs. Riley saw the housekeeping supervisor in the hall and asked her for some extra towels. The supervisor abruptly handed the towels to Mrs. Riley and then walked away without saying a word.

After checking into their room, the housekeeping supervisor knocked on the door and politely asked the Rileys if they needed anything. While talking to the Rileys, the supervisor informed them of the best restaurants in the city and mentioned that she would be available if the Rileys needed help. After resting for awhile, the Rileys unpacked their clothes. Mrs. Riley saw the maid in the hall and asked her for some extra towels. The maid abruptly handed the towels to Mrs. Riley and then walked away without saying a word.

After checking into their room, Mrs. Riley saw the housekeeping supervisor in the hall and asked her for some extra towels. The supervisor abruptly handed the towels to Mrs. Riley and then walked away without saying a word. After resting for awhile, the Rileys unpacked their clothes. Then the maid knocked on the door and politely asked the Rileys if they needed anything. The maid informed the Rileys of the best restaurants in the city and mentioned that she would be available if the Rileys needed help.

Mrs. Riley saw the maid in the hall and asked her for some extra towels. The maid abruptly handed the towels to Mrs. Riley and then walked away without saying a word. After resting for awhile, the Rileys unpacked their clothes. Then the housekeeping supervisor knocked on the door and politely asked the Rileys if they needed any help. The supervisor informed the Rileys of the best restaurants in the city and mentioned that she would be available if the Rileys needed help.

During their short stay in New York, the Rileys went to the Museum of Natural History. The Rileys were amazed at the large collection of dinosaur displays. They also enjoyed viewing the Empire State Building and South Street Seaport. By the end of the weekend, the Rileys bought many souvenirs to bring home to their friends.

Before the Rileys checked out of the hotel, they planned to leave a generous tip for one of the hotel employees. They thought they would leave a tip to the employee who was the most courteous and helpful. Mrs. Riley thought about this and then decided which hotel employee she would leave a tip for.

She decided to give the tip to the maid. The maid had been a great help to them.

They decided to give the maid a fifty dollar tip for her services. Because they loved New York City, the Rileys planned to visit it again the following year.
Introduction
Gold had been discovered in the mountains near the rural town of Dead Gulch, Montana. The government sent a major to Dead Gulch to find out how much gold there was. Dead Gulch was a rural town with few residents.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
When the major arrived at the small town store, he met a rather bright rancher who had been born and raised in Dead Gulch. The rancher said that he had considerable knowledge of the territory. After a brief conversation, the major tipped his hat and then searched the store to pick up a few supplies. While there, he talked to a dim-witted store clerk about living in Dead Gulch. The clerk replied that he had just recently moved to Dead Gulch and didn't know much about the area.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
When the major arrived at the small town store, he met a rather bright store clerk who had been born and raised in Dead Gulch. The clerk said that he had considerable knowledge of the territory. After a brief conversation, the major tipped his hat and then searched the store to pick up a few supplies. While there, he talked to a dim-witted rancher in the store about living in Dead Gulch. The rancher replied that he had just recently moved to Dead Gulch and didn't know much about the area.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
When the major arrived at the small town store, he talked to a dim-witted store clerk about living in Dead Gulch. The clerk replied that he had just recently moved to Dead Gulch and didn't know much about the area. After a brief conversation, the major tipped his hat and then searched the store to pick up a few supplies. While there, he met a rather bright rancher who had been born and raised in Dead Gulch. The rancher said that he had considerable knowledge of the territory.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
When the major arrived at the small town store, he talked to a dim-witted rancher about living in Dead Gulch. The rancher replied that he had just recently moved to Dead Gulch and didn't know much about the area. After a brief conversation, the major tipped his hat and then searched the store to pick up a few supplies. While there, he met a rather bright store clerk who had been born and raised in Dead Gulch. The clerk said that he had considerable knowledge of the territory.

Background
When the major finished talking, he walked around the store for some canned goods. He picked out what he needed for the trip. He was almost through when he noticed that he still needed some matches. He found some on a nearby shelf. After paying, he packed them in his wagon.

Inference Context
Because the major was not familiar with the mountains, he was a bit hesitant about going through them alone. Before leaving the store, the major decided to ask one of the people he met to be a guide and take him through the mountains. He had to find someone who was intelligent and familiar with the area. After considering his options, the major made a decision who he would ask for help.

Critical Sentences
The major wanted the rancher as a guide.
The rancher agreed and they left town.

Conclusion
As they made their way up into the mountains, the major hoped he would find plenty of gold.
Introduction
Mark loved to go out on Friday nights and tonight was no exception. After having a beer at the pub, Mark and his friends took a taxi to a dance club. When they arrived, Mark scanned the dance floor for some colleagues he knew.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
He saw the company's pretty secretary who often came to the club and loved to dance. Mark always enjoyed spending time with the secretary because she was interesting and friendly. As Mark was scanning the crowd, he saw the company's bookkeeper dancing. Mark thought the bookkeeper's dance movements were uncoordinated and that she appeared very clumsy.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
He saw the company's pretty bookkeeper who often came to the club and loved to dance. Mark always enjoyed spending time with the bookkeeper because she was interesting and friendly. As Mark was scanning the crowd, he saw the company's secretary dancing. Mark thought the secretary's dance movements were uncoordinated and that she appeared very clumsy.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
He saw the company's bookkeeper dancing. Mark thought the bookkeeper's dance movements were uncoordinated and that she appeared very clumsy. As Mark was scanning the crowd, he saw the company's pretty secretary who often came to the club and loved to dance. Mark always enjoyed spending time with the secretary because she was interesting and friendly.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
He saw the company's secretary dancing. Mark thought the secretary's dance movements were uncoordinated and that she appeared very clumsy. As Mark was scanning the crowd, he saw the company's pretty bookkeeper who often came to the club and loved to dance. Mark always enjoyed spending time with the bookkeeper because she was interesting and friendly.

Background
As Mark stood gazing at the crowd, his friends asked if he wanted a drink. Mark agreed and they walked over to the bar. Mark ordered a beer and sat on a stool. He and his friends watched the Red Sox on the TV. The Red Sox were down to their last out and down by a run. Mark was disgusted when the last Red Sox batter struck out.

Inference Context
He turned around on his stool and decided to ask one of his coworkers for a dance. He wanted to find a dance partner who was attractive and fun to be with. Also, it was important that his partner be a good dancer. After scanning the crowd again, Mark walked over to the coworker he wanted to ask to dance.

Critical Sentences
Mark wanted to dance with the secretary.
The secretary said it was a great idea.

Conclusion
They put down their drinks and walked out onto the dance floor. Although the dance floor was crowded, Mark had a great time.
Introduction
The Cliffs Edge was a hotel situated in the middle of a busy city. The state's prosecutor was staying at the hotel for a few days while she tried to rally support for her campaign for governor.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
During her stay, the prosecutor observed a violent argument between the manager and the hotel owner. The owner fired the manager for stealing some of the profits. He swore to get back at the owner and left the hotel in a mad rage. Then the owner called the bellhop. Because the hotel was crowded that evening, the owner asked him to stay an hour overtime. The dedicated bellhop said he would be pleased to stay.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 1st
During her stay, the prosecutor observed a violent argument between the bellhop and the hotel owner. The owner fired the bellhop for stealing some of the profits. He swore to get back at the owner and left the hotel in a mad rage. Then the owner called the manager. Because the hotel was crowded that evening, the owner asked him to stay an hour overtime. The dedicated manager said he would be pleased to stay.

Consistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
During her stay, the prosecutor observed that the hotel owner called the bellhop. Because the hotel was crowded that evening, the owner asked him to stay an hour overtime. The dedicated bellhop said he would be pleased to stay. Then the prosecutor observed a violent argument between the manager and the hotel owner. The owner fired the manager for stealing some of the profits. He swore to get back at the owner and left the hotel in a mad rage.

Inconsistent Elaboration - Appropriate Candidate mentioned 2nd
During her stay, the prosecutor observed that the hotel owner called the manager. Because the hotel was crowded that evening, the owner asked him to stay an hour overtime. The dedicated manager said he would be pleased to stay. Then the prosecutor observed a violent argument between the bellhop and the hotel owner. The owner fired the bellhop for stealing some of the profits. He swore to get back at the owner and left the hotel in a mad rage.

Background
Soon, things returned to normal again. The prosecutor decided to have breakfast in the hotel's restaurant. She decided to treat herself to some French Toast, orange juice and coffee. She ate the delicious food and paid the check. As she walked out into the hotel lobby, she noticed that a crowd had gathered around the owner's office. She saw that the owner had been strangled with a rope.

Inference Context
The prosecutor was horrified and wanted to solve the murder as quickly as possible. She knew from past experiences that murders tended to result from highly charged emotional situations. She had a hunch that the motive was revenge and that the murderer was crazed with anger. After reviewing the evidence, she called a press conference to name the logical murder suspect.

Critical Sentences
She accused the manager of the murder.
She put out a warrant for his arrest.

Conclusion
After the press conference, the prosecutor returned to her room. She had a lot of work to do if she was going to solve the case.