Excavating Visual Texts: Information Literacy, Critical Thinking, and the Graphic Novel in the Crime Fiction Classroom

Susanne F. Paterson

Carolyn B. Gamtso
University of New Hampshire - Manchester, carolyn.gamtso@unh.edu

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholars.unh.edu/unhmlibrary_pub

Recommended Citation

This Book Chapter is brought to you for free and open access by the Library at University of New Hampshire Scholars' Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in Library Community Scholarship by an authorized administrator of University of New Hampshire Scholars' Repository. For more information, please contact Scholarly.Communication@unh.edu.
Excavating Visual Texts: Information Literacy, Critical Thinking, and the Graphic Novel in the Crime Fiction Classroom

Susanne F. Paterson and Carolyn White Gamtso

“Fiction becomes evidence. Evidence becomes fiction.”¹

Introduction

When a professor constructed a crime fiction course, she wanted students to learn how to deploy multimodal analysis to interrogate the narratives presented. This operation is particularly helpful when exploring crime fiction texts, where such narratives often thematize the unreliability of the narrator. Furthermore, she wanted to extend this interrogation to that of primary and historical sources.

With this in mind, the professor enlisted the expertise of the librarian, both collaborating to deliver a critical information literacy (IL) session embedded in a mini-unit on *From Hell: Being a Melodrama in Sixteen Parts*, a graphic novel and historical fictionalization of the Whitechapel murders. *From Hell* offers the possibility for engaged reading and robust interrogation of the text itself and historical sources related to the events depicted. Techniques derived from multimodal analysis and critical IL provided a foundation for students to deconstruct those narratives, resulting in a high degree of student engagement and critical thinking.

**Why Comics?**

The comics medium is a “form in which words and images create unsynthesized narrative tracks,” opening up to readers the possibility of creating and assembling multiple stories as they read. The reader is tasked with making sense of individual panels and also knitting them into a series of coherent narratives because comics is “not only an art of fragments, of scattering, of distribution; it is also an art of conjunction, of repetition, of linking together.” Through their unique form of narrative, these texts encourage their readers to adopt “an agential role in making meaning,” whereby their own powers of analysis are called upon to integrate varying semiotically-weighted communications.

---

2 At UNH, librarians have faculty status. For the sake of clarity, in this chapter the faculty librarian will be referred to as “the librarian,” and the English professor will be referred to as “the professor.”

3 From August to November of 1888, five women who worked as prostitutes in London’s Whitechapel district were murdered by the same individual, commonly styled “Jack the Ripper” due to letters sent to the press from the supposed killer himself.


In constructing the course syllabus for an upper-level crime fiction course, the professor included literary and historical texts, films, illustrations, and a mini-unit on graphic novels. Careful thought was given to ensuring students became familiar with multimodal semiotics, “in which written-linguistic modes of meaning are part and parcel of visual, audio, and spatial patterns of meaning.” A number of reasons underpinned the selection of multimodal works: though students are exposed to visual images more than text, they do not necessarily have the skills to decode them without their being purposefully and systematically taught. In addition, although courses in English and allied disciplines privilege textual analysis, it cannot be assumed that the skills students acquire and sharpen as a result transmit to visual texts. Other compelling arguments have been made for teaching comics and graphic novels, with some stressing the importance of students becoming more active learners who “understand how images produce meaning, and become engaged in the search for this meaning.” Such arguments also emphasize the importance of these active learners acquiring a robust conception not only of the meanings produced through reading the comics but also the relationship of these narratives to broader socio-cultural contexts. Teaching visual literacy and having students apply it to graphic fiction can also be a mechanism by which their notion of a literate citizen is widened.

In addition, students’ critical thinking skills can be sharpened vis-à-vis historical events when they are taught using graphic novels. Hillary Chute observes that “the ability to use the space of the page to interlace or overlay different temporalities, to place pressure on linearity and conventional notions of sequence, causality, and progression, is a reason comics can address itself powerfully to historical and life narrative.” Students who study graphic nonfiction materials gain a heightened awareness of their own historical agency through analysis of specific techniques associated with such texts. Visual and spatial features of comics can foster an awareness of narrative uncertainty, encouraging students to think critically about the relationship between human agency and historical events. As J. Spencer Clark notes, “the individual actions of historical agents are rectified in single frames, only to be influenced, shaped, and affected by the actors and events in other frames. Thus, nonfiction graphic novels traffic in historical agency because agency is at the core of their narrative.” Comics provide a way for students to more sharply understand that historical events are done by people to people, and that narratives about these events are actively constructed by people, including themselves. By actively reading comics, students can become aware of their own agency as creators, revisers, and transmitters of narratives.

Critical Information Literacy

When invited to the classroom to help students interrogate primary newspapers referencing the Whitechapel murders, the librarian saw an opportunity to employ a critical method to the IL session, both in terms of the lesson’s content and its methodology, which she designed to encourage student involvement in the process of exploring the texts. Eamon Tewell points out the ramifications of critical information literacy (IL) for librarian’s teaching methods, as the student partici-

---


pation essential for the emergence of critical consciousness cannot be developed through mere “skill-based instruction,” but rather an “authentically student-centered mode” that “acknowledges and emboldens the learner’s agency in the educational process.” John J. Doherty notes that the process of evaluation is often taught “in strong procedural terms, not on critical terms.” Jessica Critten observes that a critical approach to IL goes further, empowering students to consider “the social, political, and cultural forces that shape and filter information” and to reflect upon their own “meaning-making process.” The theory of critical IL becomes practice through a pedagogy of active discourse; Michelle Reale points out that “[it] is through dialogue, relentless questioning, and the de-centralization of authority that a level playing field is created where students are encouraged to express their own thoughts and come to their own conclusions.” The librarian’s goal was to engage students’ capacity for critical textual engagement through hands-on research activities, guided questions, reflection, and student presentations. Stephanie Vie and Brandy Dieterle assert that “[c]ritical literacy asks us to question the language used in our world, our positionality in that world, and the often-invisible power structures in that world.” The librarian sought to lead the students toward the understanding that their own interpretations of the written and visual texts discovered in the IL session contributed to the cultural narratives surrounding the Whitechapel murders.

The librarian therefore saw her collaboration with the professor as an opportunity to create a learning activity informed by critical information literacy. First, the subject matter required an analysis of prevailing power structures in England during the late Victorian period. L. Perry Curtis demonstrates that press accounts of the killings reveal dominant ideologies regarding sexuality, gender, the poor, and immigrants. The ethnic diversity of the region furthered the narrative of the East End as an alien region. The district was home to a large number of Russian and Eastern European Jews, as well Irish, German, French, and East Asian immigrants. Second, the librarian hoped to guide the students to explore the primary materials in collaborative groups, to pose their own questions, and come to their own conclusions regarding the materials discovered. Because “[c]ritical literacy…teaches analysis and critiquing skills around the relationships between texts, language, and power,” the librarian encouraged students to parse the text of newspaper articles to uncover the economic structures and gender politics therein. She wanted to make students aware of the racist bias of news reports that sought to keep the murderer at a psychological distance. Finally, the authors sought to expand students’ critical analysis of texts in a variety of modalities. Troy Swanson describes a critical approach to IL that moves “away from the print-based model,” and asking students to analyze a variety of information artifacts broadens the scope of their conception of “information.” Just as the professor’s unit on From Hell prompted students to make meaning out of a visual text, the librarian extended students’ consciousness to written texts, foregrounding how those texts reflected and re-imposed the contemporary status quo.

23 Curtis, 33.
Course Construction

With a focus on stressing multimodal texts and the skills necessary to decode them, course readings included film adaptations and illustrations in addition to literary texts. Students were able to examine the role visual depictions of the narratives played in their understanding of the original texts and in their own ability to generate meaning from them. Thus, certain key elements of visual language and their applications were explored before students began engaging with comics. A mini-unit on crime and comics was then incorporated into the course. The comic materials were scaffolded in such a way as to activate increasing pictorial, narrative, and semiotic complexity in students’ interpretive comprehension. Students were first asked to read chapters from Will Eisner’s *Comics and Sequential Art* in order to familiarize themselves with elements of visual literacy, such as text, images, and panels; they then applied them to a selection of comic strips focused on crime fiction. Finally, students moved from crime fiction to fictionalized true crime and read extensive selections from *From Hell*, particularly Appendix 2, “Dance of the Gull Catchers.” The graphic novel posits that the Jack the Ripper protagonist is Sir William Gull, the Royal Physician to Queen Victoria. The argument is advanced that Gull is murdering prostitutes at the behest of Victoria, who wants to eliminate them because they know details about an illegitimate child fathered by her grandson, Prince Albert Victor. Gull’s actions are motivated by a masonic ritual designed to assert male supremacy over nascent acts of female autonomy.

A major reason for including *From Hell* in the course materials was because of its sophisticated and imaginative visual narrative techniques. As an exemplar of the comics medium, this text is well known, as is Moore’s reputation and status in the comics world as someone who creatively pushes the boundaries of the form. He has made clear his desire to exploit the creative medium of comics, saying that he wants to “come up with things that comics can do that could not be achieved in any other medium.” Another key motivation was *From Hell’s* quasi-historical subject-matter. As noted earlier, graphic novels portraying historical events are particularly well-positioned to invite readers to treat historical narratives as con-

---


structured and unstable. *From Hell* speculatively engages with actual crimes and it is consciously historical, in that it presents differing points-of-view of the events (including victims’ and protagonist’s), incorporating extensive research in the form of primary sources in endnotes and appendices. Thus, it can serve as a fruitful foundation for critical IL activities exploring the relationship between the crimes and the narratives constructed around them.

**Preparing for the Critical Information Literacy Session**

Prior to the librarian’s visit, the students analyzed *From Hell’s* appendix, “Gull Catchers,” a metanarrative about individuals involved in developing and perpetuating “Ripperology” (Moore actually depicts himself in this section, wryly calling such narratives “dodgy pseudo-history”). The material in “Gull Catchers” offered students a number of possibilities for attempting to resolve competing narratives, what Groensteen has called “closure,” whereby the reader “effectuates a reconciliation between distant panels and scenes.” During the class discussion before the librarian’s IL session, students noted that identical panels were repeated from the main text to the appendix, as was the professor’s intent when she selected the panels. In one case, a panel depicts a close-up of a child, Alexander; this image is repeated in the appendix, where the boy is now identified by an overlaid caption: “Of course, there’s always willful and deliberate mischief as a motive. For example, there’s Aleister Crowley.” Students had to operationalize this reconciliation of narratives visually and conceptually: the panels look identical, but the appendix iteration provides new information. The “pseudo-history” alluded to by Moore becomes evident in the way the panel has been treated as a palimpsest. Underneath the “revised” version of Moore’s history lies another, earlier, version: the boy Alexander—who was just a boy in Chapter 9—is now, in Appendix 2, the boy Aleister Crowley. A tantalizing observation was made by students during class discussion that any rereading of Chapter 9 would never be able to unerase Aleister: the boy will never just be the boy Alexander again. Here, the strong hands of Moore and Campbell worked together to ensure that students participated in the

creation of alternate narratives and were reminded of the power of multimodal
texts to shape memory and perception. The in-class analysis and discussion made
clear to students that creative, historical, and even pseudo-historical narratives are
unstable and *constructed*—by their authors and by their readers.

In Moore's unspooling of the “Ripperology” mythos in “Gull Catchers,”
key authors of these Ripper narratives—as well as some of the more well-known
candidates for Jack the Ripper—are documented by Moore and Campbell. In
so doing, the act of documentation becomes self-conscious, aesthetically con-
structed. During discussions, it became clear to students that, as characters were
brought forth, the interplay of the visual and textual in graphic novels invited
them to assess the credibility of those characters and their stories. In one panel,
Russian doctor Alexander Pedachenko, an early contender for the Ripper, is de-
scribed by the caption, “Pedachenko was manipulated by The Ochrana [Russian
Secret Police] to kill women as part of a Czarist plot to make the Metropolitan
Police look bad.”33 The story in the caption strains credulity, but it is the accom-
panying image in the panel which further destabilizes the narrative, casting it as
ludicrous: the scene illustrated is Punch and Judy, a children’s puppet show, which
centers on stock scenes of Punch physically and verbally assaulting his wife Judy
for laughs. Pedachenko is portrayed as Punch, complete with a “Russian” mous-
tache and a dagger, which he is using to stab a female puppet in Victorian dress,
meant to represent both Judy and the female victims; at the front of the puppet
booth is a puppet policeman, leaning over the stage, looking at the (out-of-frame)
children watching the show. The children’s speech balloon contains the words
“BEHIND YOU!” directed at the policeman, indicating that he’s missing the
crime. The panel allowed students to investigate a number of issues: relationships
between image and text; implications of locating a violent crime against a woman
in a violently comical children’s play-drama; self-conscious ethnic stereotyping
(the “Russian” moustache); and anti-establishment attitudes (the police being hu-
miliated). Campbell’s images amplify the absurdity of Moore’s text, insisting the
reader view the narrative as pantomime—performed, preposterous, constructed,
and unreliable. Students realized that the tonal discrepancy between text and im-
age self-consciously called into question the veracity of the “pseudo-historical”
narrative itself. Decoding this scene helped to expose the instability of narratives
generally, a lesson which is key to students’ developing critical literacy skills.

33 Moore and Campbell, 7.
The Information Literacy Session

Since Crime Fiction is an upper-level literature course, the students were adept at navigating subscription databases and other online resources, although few in the class had delved into primary newspaper sources. Because of the students’ existing facility with the mechanics of searching, as well as their understanding of inquiry strategies and source evaluation, the librarian engaged in a conversation with students that moved “beyond providing access to information to actively teaching critical thinking skills.” When the librarian arrived in class, she explained that the students would first explore reference sources to gain background information about the Whitechapel murders, and would then delve into contemporaneous newspaper accounts to ascertain how the Victorian press reported on the crimes. The students did not have an out-of-class assignment to complete after the library session: the unit was designed to deepen and enhance their previous discussion of From Hell, and to encourage them to use a similar critical lens when assessing primary source material.

Students brought laptops to class in preparation for the hands-on class exercises; the librarian placed students into groups of two or three for the research activity. Using a course-specific LibGuide to access relevant tools for the workshop, the librarian led the class to online reference sources that could provide an overview of the Whitechapel case. In groups, students analyzed encyclopedia entries through Credo Reference to learn the historical facts of the crimes, and to identify keywords to use when later searching newspaper databases for primary sources. The librarian provided students with directions and reflection questions to prompt their discussions. (i.e. Briefly summarize the encyclopedia article. Did the entry add to your understanding of the Ripper murders? What questions remain?) Once they had located and analyzed an encyclopedia entry, the groups reported what they had learned to the entire class, thus adding to the collective understanding of the murders; the investigation of the crimes; the many theories regarding the identity of the killer(s); and the cultural impact of the Whitechapel events from the Victorian era to the present.

During the exercise, students discovered that many of the encyclopedia entries included graphics from popular news sources, such as The Illustrated Police News. The librarian shared the images with the class as a whole by projecting them onto a large screen at the front of the class, asking the students to employ the visual

34 Smith, “Critical Information Literacy Instruction,” 16.
35 See: http://libraryguides.unh.edu/crimefiction.
literacy skills developed through their reading of *From Hell* to analyze these pictorial representations of the murders and the environment in which they occurred. One image from *The Illustrated Police News* made a particularly strong impact on the students, both because of its violent imagery, and because of its undisguised racism (See Fig. 1). The students noted that the illustrator(s) depicted the murder suspect as dark-skinned and bearded, an image that revealed the contemporary impulse to find Jewish suspects who “fit the Orientalist bill of Otherness with their dark complexion, black hair, black clothing, and heavy foreign accents.”

36 The librarian, classroom teacher, and students together discussed how such xenophobic attitudes affected the investigation of the crimes, and how such societal biases weave their way into cultural artifacts that inform our own understanding of historical events.

Next, the librarian invited the student groups to explore the digital archives of the *London Times*, the *Boston Globe*, the *Washington Post*, the *Los Angeles Times*, and the *New York Times*, with each group searching one database; identifying articles that provided insight into dominant media narratives of the Ripper murders; and reporting on their discoveries to the class. Students observed that the written accounts expressed the same biases reflected in the illustrations they had discovered in the reference sources and noted that while the visual texts made an immediate visceral impact, the written texts also revealed underlying cultural attitudes toward women and immigrants. Both the newspaper articles and the

press illustrations highlighted for students the Victorian societal attitudes that Alan Moore explores and interrogates in *From Hell*.

**Reflection**

With the assistance of guiding questions from the librarian and the professor (e.g. What imagery do the reporters use to describe suspects and victims? What do these descriptions reveal about Victorian attitudes toward women, immigrants, and the poor?), students uncovered narratives that reflected and reinforced dominant cultural anxieties. For example, a *London Times* article reported that police were looking for a person, nicknamed “Leather Apron,” described as having a “rather dark beard and moustache. Dress—shirt, dark jacket, dark vest and trousers, black scarf, and black felt hat. Spoke with a foreign accent.” The same article reports on the arrest of a “Polish Jew named Pizer, supposed to be ‘Leather Apron,’” a man later released. Students observed that the description could refer to any number of Eastern European Jews in the region and noted how the collective rush to judgement highlighted contemporary anti-Semitic feelings.

Students also recognized the dichotomy between the circumspect terms used to refer to the murdered women’s trade (“All three victims have been women of the lowest class”) and the detailed language used to describe the murders themselves. The class discussed how the press reports pandered both to the purported delicacies of a middle-class audience, and that same audience’s voyeuristic fear of and fascination with the poverty, immorality and violence of the East End. In this way, the press reflected how “the dominant culture reinforces certain discourses and marginalizes others.”

**Conclusion**

It became evident that prior discussions about *From Hell*, in particular their focus on narrative instability and the handling of “pseudo-historical” material in 37 “The Whitechapel Murders,” *Times* [London, England], September 11, 1888.
38 “The Whitechapel Murders.”
“Gull Catchers,” had helped to alert students in the IL session to the operations involved in creating and deploying narratives about historical events. By having students analyze *From Hell* followed by the primary materials excavated in the IL session, two major goals were met: students were empowered to see that there were a series of potential narratives embedded in the events depicted by the texts; and they became aware of their own agency in creating or augmenting these narrative possibilities. As a result, skepticism and critical positioning vis-à-vis the primary materials were students’ default stances during the session. Thanks to the discussions of how Moore and Campbell depicted narratives about whom the perpetrators could have been, there was a heightened awareness in students that graphic and textual illustrations of such perpetrators in press accounts of the events could be subject to scrutiny and deconstruction, revealing underlying narratives of subordination and dominance. Such narratives reflect the social, racial, and gender preoccupations of the time (and do so still). As Moore observes in “Gull Catchers,” the generation and proliferation of whodunit narratives about the Whitechapel murders “has never been about the murders, not the killer nor his victims. It’s about us. About our minds and how they dance.”41

---

Bibliography


